

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Inorganic fouling of an anaerobic membrane bioreactor treating leachate from the Organic Fraction of Municipal Solid Waste (OFMSW) and a polishing aerobic membrane bioreactor

Antoine P. Trzcinski* and David C. Stuckey

Department of Chemical Engineering and Chemical Technology, Imperial College of Science and Technology and Medicine, Prince Consort Road, London SW7 2BY, UK

* Corresponding author. E-mail: antoinetrzcinski@hotmail.com Tel.: +65 6592 7758

26 **Abstract**

27 The treatment of leachate (Average TCOD=11.97 g/L, 14.4% soluble) from the organic fraction
28 of municipal solid waste was investigated using a Submerged Anaerobic Membrane BioReactor
29 (SAMBR), followed by an Aerobic Membrane BioReactor (AMBR) to polish this effluent. This
30 paper investigated the exact nature and composition of the inorganic precipitate in each of the
31 reactors in the process. The flux decreased due to precipitation of calcium as monohydrocalcite
32 ($\text{CaCO}_3 \cdot \text{H}_2\text{O}$) containing traces of metals onto the SAMBR membrane because of high CO_2
33 partial pressures. Precipitation of calcium in the AMBR was also observed due to a higher pH. In
34 this case, phosphorus also precipitated with calcium in two different phases: the background
35 layer contained calcium, oxygen, carbon and small amounts of phosphorus (2-6.7%), while
36 flakes containing calcium, oxygen and higher amounts of phosphorus (10-17%) were probably
37 hydroxyapatite ($\text{Ca}_5(\text{PO}_4)_3\text{OH}$).

38

39

40 **Keywords :** Anaerobic digestion, Submerged Anaerobic Membrane Bioreactor (SAMBR),
41 Aerobic membrane bioreactor, landfill leachate, inorganic fouling.

42

43 **1. Introduction**

44 The main advantages of membrane bioreactors (MBR) include rapid start-up and a higher
45 loading rate than classical technologies (Stephenson et al., 2000), which combines in one unit the
46 removal of COD, solids and nutrients, thus giving rise to a small footprint and a very high
47 quality permeate with no suspended solids. Anaerobic MBRs have the added advantage of
48 producing energy in the form of biogas, and produce very little excess sludge reducing the
49 burden of sludge disposal. In a Submerged Anaerobic Membrane Bioreactor (SAMBR) the
50 membrane is submerged within the reactor, and membrane cleaning is accomplished by

51 recirculating the biogas as large bubbles underneath the membrane to scour it and alleviate
52 biofouling. Several researchers have also achieved fouling reduction by gas sparging (Hong et
53 al., 2002; Li et al., 2005), and other turbulence promoting techniques such as gas/liquid slug flow
54 (Mercier-Bonin et al., 2001) or polymeric particles (Imasaka et al., 1989). However, fouling
55 remains the main drawback of MBRs since it reduces flux through the membrane, and increases
56 trans-membrane pressure (TMPs) drops. Nevertheless, fouling can enhance COD removal since
57 the fouling layer acts as a secondary membrane and enhances the rejection of low molecular
58 weight (MW) solutes.

59
60 Fouling can occur by: adsorption or deposition of macromolecules onto the membrane surface;
61 by adsorption onto the pore surface; or, by complete pore-blocking. The phenomenon is
62 exacerbated by concentration polarisation as it increases the concentration of macromolecules
63 and particles in the vicinity of the membrane. Fouling can also be related to biological growth
64 due to cell attachment and extracellular polymeric substances (EPS) filling the void spaces
65 between the particles in the cake (Chu et al., 2005). Other fouling can be attributed to
66 components in the feed such as proteins, colloids and particulate materials. Colloids cover a wide
67 size range, from a few nanometers to a few micrometers, and can comprise clay minerals,
68 colloidal silica, iron, aluminium, and manganese oxides, organic colloids and suspended matter,
69 and calcium carbonate precipitates (Boussu et al., 2006; Mahvi & Razavi, 2005). Dissolved ions
70 may also precipitate in the form of struvite which is an inorganic precipitate with the chemical
71 formula: $MgNH_4PO_4 \cdot 6H_2O$, and has been reported by several investigators as playing a key role
72 in flux decline (Choo & Lee, 1996; Kang et al., 2002). Kang et al. (2002) reported that struvite
73 was found to have accumulated inside the pores of a zirconia skinned inorganic membrane, but
74 not in an organic polypropylene membrane. Choo and Lee (Choo & Lee, 1996) also found that
75 struvite plays a significant role in the consolidation of biomass cakes on the membrane surface.

76 Struvite is expected to be a problem in MBRs treating municipal solid waste (MSW) or the
77 leachate because it contains all the elements required to form struvite. Struvite precipitation is
78 also facilitated when the pH increases, and as a result acidic solutions are required to dissolve the
79 inorganic foulant (Kang et al., 2002). Other inorganic foulants in anaerobic environments can
80 also include CaCO₃ polymorphs such as calcite, aragonite, vaterite, monohydrocalcite, ikaite and
81 amorphous calcium carbonate (in order of decreasing stability) (Meiron et al., 2011; Salek et al.,
82 2016). However, the precipitation of inorganic salts can also be affected by module geometry
83 and membrane materials (Shih et al., 2005), and there is limited information on the effect of
84 these factors on fouling mechanisms. However, there is very little information available
85 describing inorganic fouling on membrane surfaces (Shirazi et al., 2010).

86

87 In the SAMBR, biogas is recirculated to scour the membrane surface which results in high CO₂
88 partial pressures. Information about inorganic fouling under these conditions in a SAMBR
89 treating leachate from the organic fraction of municipal solid waste (OFMSW) is poorly
90 documented. This paper presents a detailed investigation into the fate of inorganics and dissolved
91 ions in a novel process treating OFMSW leachate, and identifies the inorganic foulants on the
92 membranes.

93

94 **2. Materials and methods**

95 *2.1. Leachate from the Organic Fraction of Municipal Solid Waste (OFMSW)*

96 The synthetic leachate used in this study was producing in a bench scale anaerobic reactor (20L)
97 from real components of Municipal Solid Waste: 41.3% kitchen wastes, 10.8% garden wastes
98 and 47.9% paper wastes on a wet basis as documented in a previous study (Trzcinski & Stuckey,
99 2009a). The leachate had the following properties: pH: 6-7.5, SCOD: 1,070-2,925 mg/L
100 (average: 1,730 mg/L), TCOD: 5.72-26.78 g/L (average: 11.97 g/L), Volatile fatty acids: 155-

101 1,290 mg/L as COD (average: 570 mg/L), Ammonia-nitrogen: 7-140 mg N/L (average: 44 mg
102 N/L), Phosphorus: 3.9-24 mg P/L as orthophosphates (average: 11 mg/L).

103

104 *2.2. Membrane BioReactors (MBRs)*

105 The Submerged Anaerobic Membrane BioReactor (SAMBR) was a three litre reactor fitted with
106 a Kubota polyethylene flat sheet membrane of 0.1 m² of total surface and a pore size of 0.4
107 microns. The SAMBR was maintained at 35 ± 1°C, and details of the reactor and inoculation can
108 be found elsewhere (Trzcinski & Stuckey, 2009b). The SAMBR was fed continuously at organic
109 loading rates in the range of 1-19.8 g COD·L⁻¹·day⁻¹ (average: 8.1 g COD·L⁻¹·day⁻¹).

110 One pump was used to set a constant flux through the membrane, while some of the permeate
111 was recycled back to the SAMBR in order to set the hydraulic retention time (HRT). The biogas
112 sparging rate was set at 5 L/min (LPM) to minimize cake formation on the membrane. The
113 permeate from the SAMBR was fed to an Aerobic Membrane BioReactor (AMBR) for
114 polishing. The AMBR was identical to the SAMBR except that it was maintained at ambient
115 temperature (21-22°C), and was inoculated with aerobic biomass from a wastewater plant at an
116 initial MLTSS and MLVSS of 3 and 2.3 g/l, respectively, and air was used to mix the reactor
117 contents at 2 LPM.

118

119 *2.3. Analytical methods*

120 The measurement of pH (Jenway 3020 pH Meter) was accurate to within ±0.02 units. The
121 measurement of Mixed Liquor Total Suspended Solids (TSS), Volatile Suspended Solids (VSS)
122 and Fixed Suspended Solids (FSS) was carried out weekly according to Standard Methods
123 (APHA, 2012). The coefficient of variation (COV) for ten identical samples was 4%, 3.1% and
124 7.1% for TSS, VSS and FSS, respectively. The Soluble Chemical Oxygen Demand (SCOD)
125 analysis was carried out biweekly as in Standard Methods (APHA, 2012) after filtration through

126 a 0.45 μm filter (Sartorius, Minisart), and the COV for ten identical samples was 2.6%. Volatile
127 fatty acids (VFAs) were measured biweekly using a Shimadzu Gas Chromatograph with a flame-
128 ionized detector and a SGE capillary column (12m \times 0.53mm ID-BP21 0.5 μm); the COV was 3%
129 for ten identical samples. Ammonia-Nitrogen was measured biweekly using the Nesslerization
130 method by reading absorbance at 425 nm on a Shimadzu spectrophotometer; the COV was 6.6%
131 for 10 identical samples. The measurement of orthophosphates was carried out biweekly
132 according to the vanadomolybdophosphoric acid colorimetric method described in Standard
133 Methods (APHA, 2012). The absorbance was read on a spectrophotometer at 470 nm, and the
134 coefficient of variance for ten identical samples was $\pm 0.6\%$.

135 The method for alkalinity followed the procedure described in Standard Methods (APHA, 2012).
136 Weekly samples were titrated potentiometrically to an end-point of pH 4.5 with 0.1 N H_2SO_4 .

137 The COV for 10 identical samples was within 2.7%. The calculation of alkalinity is shown below:

138 Alkalinity as mg $\text{CaCO}_3/\text{L} = A \times N \times 50,000 / \text{mL sample}$

139 where: A= ml standard acid used, N= normality of standard acid. The ions Na^+ , K^+ , Mg^{++} , Ca^{2+} ,

140 Cl^- , PO_4^{3-} , were analyzed weekly using an Ion Chromatograph (Dionex) as described by the

141 American Public Health Association (APHA, 2012). The COV for the ions listed above were 2,

142 0.2, 0.5, 0.6, 1.1 and 3.4 % for 5 identical samples, respectively. The detection limit was between

143 50 and 100 ppb.

144 Fouled membranes were analyzed by scanning electron microscopy (SEM) and energy

145 dispersive X-ray (EDX) spectroscopy. SEM samples were fixed overnight at 4 $^\circ\text{C}$ in 3%

146 glutaraldehyde and kept at pH 7.2 by a 0.1M phosphate buffer. Samples were then dehydrated in

147 a graded ethanol/water series (10-30-50-70-90-100%) for 20 minutes at each concentration, and

148 then dried for a day at 30 $^\circ\text{C}$. Samples were sputtered-coated with gold or carbon (30mA for 2.5

149 minutes, vacuum 0.2 Torr) prior to SEM-EDX analyses. Specimens were examined and

150 photographed under a scanning electron microscopy (JEOL JSM-5610LV). Energy Dispersive

151 X-Ray analysis was conducted with an EDX-60 (Oxford instrument-incax-sight), and the EDX
152 analyzer was connected to a scanning electron microscope (model JSM-840A). More than one
153 point on the sample was analyzed by EDX. Powdered inorganic precipitates from the membranes
154 were also analyzed using a Bruker AXS using X-Ray Fluorescence technology (XRF). The exact
155 number of replicates is given along with the results.

156

157 *2.4. Membrane cleaning*

158 A cleaning procedure adapted from (Akram, 2006) was performed in order to determine the
159 relative contribution to fouling due to internal and external, organic and inorganic fouling of the
160 SAMBR and AMBR membranes. The virgin membrane flux of a new Kubota membrane was
161 determined by submerging it in distilled water under 1 meter of hydrostatic head. The flux, f_0 ,
162 was determined in triplicate, and the average \pm standard deviation was $f_0 = 251 \pm 6$ LMH. At the
163 end of the experiment, the fouled membrane flux, f_1 , was measured with distilled water under the
164 same conditions as described. The flux, f_1 , was the result of all fouling types, i.e. organic and
165 inorganic, external and internal. The flux drop, FD1, due to all types of fouling was calculated as
166 $FD1 = f_0 - f_1$.

167 The membrane was then cleaned using different methods and chemicals in sequence. Firstly,
168 lukewarm water and a brush were used to remove the external organic fouling (biofilm) formed
169 on the membrane, assuming that any inorganic foulants would not be removed by this technique
170 due to their strong attachment. The measured flux, f_2 , was then the residual flux due to combined
171 internal and external inorganic fouling. The flux drop, FD3, due to internal and external
172 inorganic foulants was then calculated as $FD3 = f_0 - f_2$. The flux drop due to organic external
173 foulants, or biofilm alone (FD2), was obtained as $FD2 = FD1 - FD3$.

174

175 The membrane was then soaked in 1% sodium hypochlorite for 2 hours to remove external and
176 internal organic foulants, and the flux was recorded as f_3 . The flux drop due to inorganic foulants
177 only was then calculated as $FD_4 = f_0 - f_3$. Finally, the membrane was soaked in 1% oxalic acid
178 for 2 hours to remove inorganic foulants, and the flux was recorded as f_4 .

179

180 **3. Results and discussion**

181 *3.1. Contribution of SAMBR and AMBR to overall COD removal in leachate*

182 The AMBR was started up at MLTSS and MLVSS concentrations of 3, and 2.3 g/L,
183 respectively, and was fed with the stabilized leachate, i.e. the permeate from SAMBR2. Hence
184 the feed contained no suspended solids. Figure 1 shows the contribution of both the SAMBR and
185 AMBR to the total COD removal from the OFMSW leachate at various HRTs from 5 days
186 during the start-up down to 0.4-0.6 days. The COD removal in the SAMBR was in the range of
187 89.7-98 % (Average: 94.5%), while the total COD removal increased into the range of 92.2-
188 98.4% (Average: 96.1%) due to the polishing action of the AMBR. The results demonstrated the
189 excellent resilience of the SAMBR to organic shocks at loading rates as high as $19.8 \text{ g COD} \cdot \text{L}^{-1} \cdot \text{day}^{-1}$,
190 and HRTs as low as 0.4 days. Between 13.6% and 50.8% (Average: 26%) of the
191 SAMBR permeate COD was degraded in the AMBR. This illustrates the refractory nature of the
192 SAMBR permeate.

193

194 *3.2 Effect of the HRT on Flux and pH in the AMBR*

195 The pH in the AMBR started at 7.25 but then rapidly increased to 8.5 on day 4 and then
196 remained in the range 8.2-8.75 at all tested HRTs (Figure 2). The feed to the AMBR was
197 saturated in CO_2 because biogas was used in the SAMBR for mixing and scouring purposes. Due
198 to air sparging in the open AMBR, the CO_2 partial pressure dropped leading to lower dissolved

199 CO₂ according to Henry's Law. As a result of CO₂ stripping the carbonic acid equilibrium
200 shifted which caused the pH to rise.

201

202 The flux was found to decrease gradually from 3.5 LMH to 1.3 LMH towards the end of the
203 study indicating that considerable membrane fouling took place (Figure 2). It was found that
204 dissolved inorganic salts started to increase in the AMBR bulk, as evidenced by the mixed liquor
205 Fixed Suspended Solids (MLFSS) that increased from 0.7 g/L to 1.9 g/L during the study
206 (Supplementary material S1). Moreover, the MLVSS/MLTSS decreased accordingly from 76%
207 to 45% during the course of the study (Supplementary material S1) indicating a decrease in
208 organic content of the suspended solids in the AMBR. In contrast with the organic shocks
209 experienced in the SAMBR, the AMBR was found to experience inorganic shocks when the
210 HRT was reduced and this led to accumulation of dissolved solids in the bulk.

211 Figure 2 also shows that the flux in the AMBR was decreasing over time. Therefore, it is very
212 likely that calcium carbonate precipitating on the membrane was causing the flux to drop. Visual
213 inspection of the membrane indicated a hard, off-white, chalky deposit similar to limescale, and
214 contact with a drop of HCl provoked an immediate fizzing. Precipitation was also found to occur
215 in the permeate tubing; a sample was taken, rinsed with plenty of water and then dissolved in
216 deionized water with HCl. It was then filtered through a 0.2 micron filter and analysed on the ion
217 chromatograph which confirmed that the main element was calcium.

218

219 *3.3 Change in dissolved ion concentration in the process*

220 High salt levels can cause bacterial cells to dehydrate due to osmotic pressure, and Na⁺ is more
221 toxic than any other salt on a molar basis. It is also known that cations determine the toxicity of
222 salts (McCarty & McKinney, 1961). Sodium, potassium, magnesium, calcium, phosphate and
223 sulphate are present in the influent of anaerobic digesters, and they are all required for microbial

224 growth. Moderate concentrations stimulate microbial growth, but excessive amounts can cause
225 inhibition or toxicity (Soto et al., 1993). Very little data is available for full-scale plants as ions
226 are not systematically measured to assess the health of anaerobic digesters.

227

228 Ion concentrations in the feed (OFMSW leachate), SAMBR permeate and AMBR permeate were
229 monitored to investigate the health of the process, as well as the fate of ions in the process and
230 the possibility of precipitation. The concentrations of NH_4^+ , Na^+ , K^+ , Mg^{2+} , Ca^{2+} , Cl^- , PO_4^{3-} are
231 plotted against time in Figure 3. The concentration of NH_4^+ was relatively low in the OFMSW
232 leachate, as most of the nitrogen was still in the proteinaceous form. The NH_4^+ concentration
233 increased significantly in the SAMBR permeate due to protein degradation to ammonia under
234 anaerobic conditions. In the AMBR, ammonia concentration was virtually zero as it was shown
235 in a previous study that nitrification took place in the AMBR (Trzcinski & Stuckey, 2009b).
236 In this study, the AMBR started with a sodium concentration over 1.5 g Na^+ /L due to Owen et
237 al.'s biomedium (1979) added for the start-up, but over time the concentration stabilized to about
238 600 mg Na^+ /L; this decrease could be due to sodium uptake for bacterial growth. In contrast,
239 there was a slight increase in Cl^- and K^+ concentrations during the study.

240

241 Excessive amounts of calcium can lead to the precipitation of carbonate which may result in the
242 scaling of reactors (Chen et al., 2008). It has been reported in the literature that calcium
243 concentrations in a real landfill leachate could be as high as 976 mg/L (Zayen et al., 2008).
244 Initially, calcium concentrations were in the range 20-60 mg/L, and the levels were similar in the
245 feed and both permeates suggesting that no precipitation occurred in the system. However, as the
246 level started to increase to 160 mg/L in the feed, significantly lower concentrations were
247 observed in both permeates showing that a loss of dissolved calcium occurred in the process. It

248 was therefore clear that calcium carbonates were precipitating in the SAMBR or on its
249 membrane.

250

251 High levels of magnesium and phosphate are not recommended because they can precipitate as
252 struvite ($\text{NH}_4\text{MgPO}_4 \cdot 6\text{H}_2\text{O}$). Because phosphate concentrations are usually lower than ammonia
253 and magnesium in an anaerobic digester, they will determine whether struvite precipitates or not.
254 The magnesium level remained between 100 and 200 mg/L in all the reactors, and then increased
255 to 200-250 mg/L in the OFMSW leachate and the two permeates. In fact, the Mg^{2+} concentration
256 was always slightly higher in the two permeates showing that it could not have precipitated to
257 form struvite as it was not removed from the liquid phase.

258

259 Phosphates (PO_4^{3-}) were found at a relatively low concentration in the feed and effluents, except
260 in the AMBR that started up at about 140 mg/L, presumably due to the level in the inoculum and
261 initial biomedium. The concentrations in the feed and permeate were then stable in the range of
262 20-40 mg/L, showing that it was not removed from the liquid phase. Using the solubility product
263 it is possible to predict if struvite can precipitate. The maximum concentration of NH_4^+ , Mg^{2+}
264 and PO_4^{3-} in this study were 161, 246 and 25 mg/L, respectively, and the negative logarithm of
265 the solubility product ($\text{pK}_s = -\log K_s$) was equal to 7.6 which is lower than that of struvite
266 which is in the range 12.6 - 13.3 (Ohlinger et al., 1998). Thus in the present study, struvite did
267 not precipitate because of the low concentrations of phosphate, ammonia and magnesium, and
268 the neutral pH. This was confirmed by Stratful et al. (2001) who noticed that no struvite
269 precipitation occurred at pH 7 with concentrations of magnesium, ammonium and
270 orthophosphate equal to 187, 266 and 742 mg/L, respectively, while only a minute amount was
271 produced at pH 7.5.

272 This study suggests, therefore, that struvite precipitation is unlikely when treating a leachate
273 from real components of the organic fraction of municipal solid waste such as garden, kitchen
274 and paper waste; however, calcium is more likely to cause problems. In fact, direct treatment of
275 leachate containing calcium in an anaerobic membrane bioreactor should be avoided due to
276 inorganic precipitation on the membrane. Calcium precipitation should be carefully controlled in
277 a location (a separate precipitation unit) where it does not adversely affect the membrane
278 filtration process. Moreover, this research also demonstrated that CO₂ could be sequestered in
279 the SAMBR by mineral carbonation. This offers an interesting option to remove CO₂ from the
280 biogas and increase its calorific value (Salek et al., 2016).

281

282 *3.4 Change in alkalinity in the process*

283 In theory the alkalinity should not change because the net reaction involving CO₂ stripping in the
284 AMBR removes the same number of equivalents of negatively contributing species (H⁺) as
285 positively contributing species (HCO₃⁻). However, the precipitation of calcium carbonate has a
286 strong influence on alkalinity; it will remove Ca²⁺ and CO₃²⁻ from solution, and CO₃²⁻ will
287 decrease the alkalinity by 2 times its molar concentration. Precipitation of calcium carbonate was
288 observed in our system, and the decrease in alkalinity was confirmed by titrating the feed,
289 SAMBR permeate and AMBR permeate. The alkalinity in OFMSW leachate was around 2,000-
290 3,000 mg eq. CaCO₃/L, except on day 67 where it reached 5,000 mg eq. CaCO₃/L. The SAMBR
291 and AMBR permeates were found to contain less alkalinity, in particular around day 67 when it
292 dropped to 2,250 and 750 mg eq. CaCO₃/L, respectively (Figure 1, bottom). Borzacconi et al.
293 (1999) have also observed that calcium ions can precipitate as CaCO₃ at a pH around 8. The
294 maximum concentration of calcium before precipitation can be predicted using the solubility
295 product assuming that the interference of other ions can be neglected. If $4.47 \cdot 10^{-9}$ is taken for K_{sp}
296 (Seely, 2008; Weast, 1963), the maximum solubility of Ca²⁺ in the AMBR is about 3.1 mg/L at

297 pH 8.5. Furthermore, this value shows a quadratic dependence with the concentration of H^+ so
298 that the maximum Ca^{2+} concentration is 100 times greater at pH 7 than at pH 8. In the SAMBR
299 at 35°C, the pH was 7 but the partial pressure of carbon dioxide was 0.2 atm (assuming 20% CO_2
300 in the headspace), and hence the CO_2 concentration in the liquid phase is $5.24 \cdot 10^{-3}$ M according
301 to Henry's law. The solubility of calcium at pH 7 is normally around 2,850 mg/L, but because of
302 the high partial pressure of carbon dioxide the solubility in SAMBR2 was only about 5.1 mg/L.
303 Thus precipitation can also occur in the SAMBR as well as in the AMBR if the calcium
304 concentration is greater than these theoretical values.

305

306 *3.5 Identification of the inorganic precipitate on the SAMBR membrane*

307 Scanning Electron Microscopy (SEM) was used to investigate the morphology and structure of
308 the inorganic precipitate found on the SAMBR membrane which appeared as a homogeneous
309 layer with little apparent porosity. This technique was coupled to Energy-Dispersive X-rays
310 (EDX) in order to determine the chemical composition of the precipitate, although the
311 inaccuracy of the technique increases with inhomogeneous and rough samples. Four sites were
312 scanned, and the weight percentages of the four spectra are given in Table 1 along with the
313 theoretical weight percentage of known minerals containing calcium: anhydrous calcium
314 carbonate or calcite, dolomite, monohydrocalcite and ikaite. Although very close to one another,
315 the four spectra showed some variability as indicated by the percentages varying within 4%, and
316 there was co-precipitation with magnesium and iron. In fact, gold (Au) from the sample
317 preparation was found to interfere with Phosphorus (P) in the elemental chromatograph because
318 both elements peak at 2 keV.

319

320 Some carbon and oxygen could also be attributed to dissolved organic matter; this means that the
321 oxygen percentage actually due to calcium carbonate could be overestimated. However, dolomite

322 is unlikely to have precipitated because of the low percentage of magnesium in the unknown
323 sample compared to the 13% theoretically present in dolomite. Calcite (an anhydrous form of
324 calcium carbonate) did not match well due its lower carbon and higher calcium content
325 compared to the sample, while the hydrated forms of calcium carbonate, such as
326 monohydrocalcite, had a better match.

327 Nonetheless, these forms contain hydrogen that cannot be detected by the EDS technique. As a
328 result, the percentage could be overestimated because they do not take hydrogen into account.

329 Further analysis using X-Ray Fluorescence technology (XRF) (Table 2) provided a very similar
330 percentage of calcium (~28%), but with a much smaller statistical error. The analysis also
331 showed that impurities such as phosphorus, silicon, magnesium, iron, sulphur, potassium,
332 manganese and aluminium co-precipitated, but most importantly, the analysis revealed that 29%
333 of the sample was inorganic, and hence 71% was organic (C, O and H). By comparing this with
334 the last column in Table 1, it was found that the mineral with the closest organic content was
335 indeed monohydrocalcite with 66%. This small discrepancy could be due to dissolved organic
336 matter trapped within the precipitate. Furthermore, monohydrocalcite is known for its bizarre
337 occurrences, which include inside the otoliths of the tiger shark, the bladder of a guinea pig
338 (Catherine et al., 1977), and the final stages of decomposition of the putrefying flesh of the giant
339 saguaro cactus (Garvie, 2003); these occurrences suggest a biochemical origin is possible. In
340 biological systems, some authors have reported that the precipitated minerals were related to the
341 bacterial metabolism and, consequently, could be considered biologically induced (Gonzalez-
342 Munoz et al., 2008). Amino acid metabolism results in the release of ammonia and CO₂ that
343 increase the pH and CO₃²⁻ concentration, creating an alkaline environment that favours
344 monohydrocalcite precipitation. This precipitation may also be related to heterogeneous
345 nucleation on negatively charged points of biological structures, and these functional groups are
346 able to attract positive ions such as Ca²⁺. In aerobic granules, Zhou et al. (2013) characterized the

347 calcium compounds and tested by energy dispersive X-ray and X-ray diffraction (XRD) the
348 accumulation of calcium carbonate and certain magnesium compounds as $\text{Ca}_7\text{Mg}_2\text{P}_6\text{O}_{24}$. Mañas
349 et al. (2011) discovered calcium deposit in the inner part of aerobic granules as hydroxyl-apatite
350 ($\text{Ca}_5(\text{PO}_4)_3(\text{OH})$). Juang et al. (2010) cultivated stable granules from continuous-flow reactors
351 and noted that large amounts of phosphates and hydroxides of calcium and iron were formed in
352 the granules to enhance the granule stability. In an anaerobic membrane bioreactor, Lin et al.
353 (2011) reported that the cake layer on the membrane was formed by organic substances and
354 inorganic elements such as 71.67% C, 9.03% O, 4.45% Ca, 1.94% Mg, 1.72% Al, 1.46% Si,
355 0.15% K, etc, but the low percentage of Calcium indicates that fouling was more organic in
356 nature.

357 These studies suggest strongly that a biofilm on the membrane of the SAMBR could have
358 triggered the precipitation of monohydrocalcite. Moreover, as the concentration of humic acids is
359 greater near the membrane in the concentration polarization layer, it is very likely that calcium
360 will form aggregates on the membrane because of the higher density of negatively charged
361 solutes near the membrane.

362

363 *3.5 Identification of the inorganic precipitate on the AMBR membrane*

364 SEM-EDX was also used to investigate the morphology and structure of the inorganic precipitate
365 found on the membrane in the AMBR. Compared to the SAMBR membrane, the precipitate was
366 much more heterogeneous with a rougher surface. Several random points on the samples were
367 analyzed by EDX, and all the spectra contained calcium, oxygen and phosphorus (2-6.7%) as the
368 main elements, with traces of metals (Fe, Al, Mg, Si, S, Na, Cl, Mn) (Table 3). It was found that
369 calcium could precipitate in two different phases; a background precipitate made of small
370 nodules, or as long and sharp flakes of about 70 microns growing in bundles and pointing
371 upwards. The former phase contained small amounts of manganese, iron, magnesium,

372 manganese, silicon, aluminium, sulphur, chloride and sodium (<1% by weight), whereas the
373 flakes contained almost no impurities, which indicates that the flakes were in a purer form than
374 the background (Table 3). Moreover, the flakes were characterized by significantly higher
375 amounts of phosphorus (10-17%) compared to the background (2-6%). Chesters (2009) obtained
376 very similar SEM pictures with flat needles which he assumed to be hydroxyapatite crystals.
377 Unfortunately, as the samples were coated with carbon to avoid interferences when using gold
378 coating, the carbon percentage was not available. Spectra of the flakes varied within a wide
379 range of calcium (19-59%), oxygen (31-64%) and phosphorus (10-17%) making its
380 identification particularly difficult. Several potential known minerals are listed in Table 3 with
381 their Ca, O and P composition for comparison.

382
383 Nonetheless, it is very likely that the background precipitate was comprised of calcium carbonate
384 containing many impurities. The calcite background may have acted as nucleation spots for the
385 formation of other amorphous calcium carbonate clusters. Occurrence of nucleation on the
386 calcite seed surface as a secondary nucleation site is a well accepted mechanism (Salek et al.,
387 2016). With respect to the flakes, their high P content suggests a calcium phosphate precipitate,
388 instead of calcium carbonate, such as calcium hydrogen phosphate (or brushite $\text{CaHPO}_4 \cdot 2\text{H}_2\text{O}$,
389 $K_{\text{sp}} = 10^{-6.69}$), dicalcium phosphate anhydrate (CaHPO_4 , $K_{\text{sp}} = 10^{-6.9}$ (Montastruc, 2003)),
390 amorphous calcium phosphate ($\text{Ca}_3(\text{PO}_4)_2$, $K_{\text{sp}} = 10^{-24}$ (Mamais et al., 1994)), octacalcium
391 phosphate ($\text{Ca}_4\text{H}(\text{PO}_4)_3 \cdot 2.5\text{H}_2\text{O}$, $K_{\text{sp}} = 10^{-49.6}$ (Montastruc et al., 2003)), hydroxyapatite
392 ($\text{Ca}_5(\text{PO}_4)_3\text{OH}$, $K_{\text{sp}} = 10^{-46.8}$ (Barat et al., 2008)) or carbonated hydroxyapatite
393 ($\text{Ca}_{10}(\text{PO}_4)_6(\text{CO}_3)_x(\text{OH})_{2-2x}$, $K_{\text{sp}} < 1 \cdot 10^{-100}$ (Ito et al., 1997)). Furthermore, the same authors
394 (Montastruc et al., 2003) found that both dicalcium phosphate dihydrate, and amorphous calcium
395 phosphate, can crystallize at a pH lower than 7.3, and only amorphous calcium phosphate at a pH
396 higher than 7.3. However, calcium phosphate precipitation follows the Ostwald rule, which

397 states that the least thermodynamically stable phase is the first one formed, which works as a
398 precursor of the most stable phase (Montastruc et al., 2003). In this case, carbonated
399 hydroxyapatite would be the least thermodynamically stable phase forming on the calcium
400 carbonate background as a precursor for a more stable calcium phosphate. Several authors
401 reported that the presence of phosphates inhibits calcite growth due to the adsorption of
402 phosphates on the calcite surface, which enables the formation of calcium phosphates (Lin &
403 Singer, 2005; Plant & House, 2002; Shintaro & Keisuke, 2012). Although it is a metastable
404 phase with respect to calcite and aragonite, monohydrocalcite ($\text{CaCO}_3 \cdot \text{H}_2\text{O}$) is a better adsorbent
405 than calcite and aragonite due to its greater surface area (Shintaro & Keisuke, 2012). This is in
406 line with Kim et al. (2007) who observed low levels of residual PO_4^{3-} , and they attributed this to
407 calcium that might preferentially react with orthophosphates to produce hydroxyapatite,
408 dicalcium phosphate or octacalcium phosphate. In abiotic batch adsorption tests, Shintaro and
409 Keisuke (2012) showed that at low phosphate concentrations, phosphate was removed by
410 sorption of phosphate during the transformation of monohydrocalcite to calcite, but at high
411 concentrations (>10.6 mg/L), amorphous calcium phosphate ($\text{Ca}_3(\text{PO}_4)_2 \cdot x\text{H}_2\text{O}$) was likely to be
412 formed.

413
414 Borzacconi et al. (1999) also observed that calcium can form complexes with organic matter,
415 orthophosphates and polyphosphates, which will diminish the phosphorus available for the
416 microorganisms or even for struvite. Sindelar et al. (2015) also reported that dissolved organic
417 carbon and phosphorus can co-precipitate with calcium at high pH.

418 Le Corre et al. (2005) and Doyle and Parsons (2002) observed that calcium ions can affect
419 struvite crystal growth, and leads to the formation of an amorphous calcium phosphate. This
420 study confirmed that struvite precipitation did not occur because the available phosphates

421 precipitated with calcium on the membrane, keeping the solution undersaturated with respect to
422 struvite.

423
424 From all these considerations, and from the light shed by other authors, it seems very likely that
425 the background precipitate was amorphous calcium carbonate, and the presence of phosphates
426 inhibited its growth due to the adsorption of phosphates, which enabled the formation of calcium
427 phosphates. The low level of impurities in these flakes suggests a mineral with a more crystalline
428 structure such as hydroxyapatite which is the most stable calcium phosphate.

429

430 *3.6 Quantification of flux drop due to inorganic fouling*

431

432 At the end of the study, a cleaning procedure (Akram, 2006) was performed in order to
433 determine the relative contribution to fouling due to internal and external, organic and inorganic
434 fouling in the SAMBR and AMBR; Table 4 documents the contribution of each component of
435 fouling. The flux drop due to an organic biofilm alone (FD2) was obtained by subtracting FD1
436 (due to combined internal, external, organic and inorganic fouling) and FD3 (external inorganic
437 layer and internal fouling). It can be seen that 98% of the clean water flux from the SAMBR
438 membrane was lost because of the combined effects of all types of foulants, i.e. external,
439 internal, organic and inorganic foulants. The flux f_2 (without the external biofilm removed by a
440 sponge and hot water) was only 13.6 LMH, which means that 94% of the flux drop was due to
441 external inorganics combined with internal fouling. This indicates that in the SAMBR the
442 external organic fouling or biofilm (FD2) played a minor role in total fouling of the SAMBR
443 (less than 4%). In contrast, the flux drop (FD2) due to external organic fouling or biofilm on the
444 AMBR membrane accounted for 30% of the total flux drop (FD1), indicating that adhesion of
445 bacteria onto the AMBR membrane was more pronounced.

446
447 Afterwards, the membrane was chemically cleaned in a 1% sodium hypochlorite solution for 2
448 hours to remove all organic foulants. These include organics left on the external surface and
449 organic foulants inside the membrane pores. The flux f_3 recovered after this cleaning was only
450 43 ± 1 LMH, which is considerably lower than the initial flux, and suggests that organic material
451 played a minor role in the internal and external fouling. In fact, the total flux drop due to
452 inorganic fouling regardless of internal or external material (FD4) can be calculated by
453 subtracting f_3 from f_0 , which gives 208 LMH. Data in Table 4 also showed that inorganic fouling
454 accounted for 83% and 32% of the total flux drop in the SAMBR and AMBR, respectively. This
455 confirmed that precipitation of inorganics took place preferentially in the SAMBR due to high
456 CO_2 partial pressures and high calcium concentrations.

457
458 The membrane was then soaked in a 1% oxalic acid solution ($\text{pH} < 2$) for 2 hours in an attempt to
459 remove inorganic foulants, as recommended by the membrane manufacturer. After 2 hours
460 soaking the flux measured afterwards was only 60 LMH, suggesting severe inorganic fouling
461 which would require longer soaking times and stronger chemicals. We then attempted to use 1%
462 hydrochloric acid for 2 hours, and then 1% hydrochloric acid with 1% sodium hypochlorite for 4
463 hours. The first cleaning attempt resulted in a flux of 94 LMH, while the last one resulted in a
464 flux of 106 LMH.

465
466 Similarly to the SAMBR membrane, the original flux in the AMBR membrane could not be
467 completely recovered, even with hydrochloric acid instead of oxalic acid. However, the flux after
468 HCl cleaning was 183 LMH which was still lower than the 250 LMH of the virgin membrane.
469 Using both the hydrochloric acid and the sodium hypochlorite solutions at 1% for 2 hours
470 resulted in a flux of 211 LMH, indicating that some residual fouling could be due to a close

471 association of organics and inorganics. The fact that it was easier to clean the AMBR membrane
472 also indicates that fouling in the AMBR was less severe, which is in line with Table 4.

473

474 **4. Conclusions**

475 A Submerged Anaerobic Membrane BioReactor (SAMBR) and a polishing Aerobic Membrane
476 BioReactor (AMBR) achieved 96% COD removal at low HRTs of 0.4 days during the anaerobic
477 treatment of leachate. However, calcium (160 mg/L) in the leachate was found to precipitate on
478 the SAMBR membrane causing severe fouling, and the precipitate was found to be
479 monohydrocalcite. It was found that calcium precipitated in two different phases in the AMBR:
480 the inorganic layer on the membrane consisted of nodules of calcium carbonate with traces of
481 phosphorus. On top of this layer grew flake shaped precipitates made of pure hydroxyapatite
482 $\text{Ca}_5(\text{PO}_4)_3(\text{OH})$.

483

484

485 **Supplementary materials**

486 Details of the inorganic precipitates can be found in electronic annex.

487

488 **Acknowledgement**

489 This research was supported by a grant from the Department of Environment, Food and Rural
490 Affairs (DEFRA) in the UK.

491

492

References

493

494 Akram, A. 2006. Stability and performance improvement of a Submerged Anaerobic Membrane
495 Bioreactor (SAMBR) for wastewater treatment. in: *Department of Chemical Engineering and*
496 *Chemical Technology*, Imperial College London. London.

497 APHA. 2012. *Standard Methods for the Examination of Water and Wastewater*. American
498 Public Health Association, Washington D.C.

499 Aquino, S.F., Stuckey, D.C. 2004. Soluble microbial products formation in anaerobic chemostats
500 in the presence of toxic compounds. *Water Research*, **38**(2), 255-266.

501 Barat, R., Bouzas, A., Marti, N., Ferrer, J., Seco, A. 2008. Precipitation assessment in
502 wastewater treatment plants operated for biological nutrient removal: A case study in Murcia,
503 Spain. *Journal of Environmental Management*, **90**(2), 850-857.

504 Borzacconi, L., Lopez, I., Ohanian, M., Vinas, M. 1999. Anaerobic-aerobic treatment of
505 municipal solid waste leachate. *Environmental Technology*, **20**(2), 211-217.

506 Boussu, K., Belpaire, A., Volodin, A., Van Heasendonck, C., Van der Meeren, P., Vandecasteele,
507 C., Van der Bruggen, B. 2006. Influence of membrane and colloid characteristics on fouling of
508 nanofiltration membranes. *Journal of Membrane Science*, **289**(1-2), 220-230.

509 Catherine, H., Skinner, K., Osbaldiston, G.W., Wilner, A.N. 1977. Monohydrocalcite in a guinea
510 pig bladder stone, a novel occurrence. *American Mineralogist*, **62**, 273 - 277.

511 Chen, S., Sun, D., Chung, J.-S. 2008. Simultaneous removal of COD and ammonium from
512 landfill leachate using an anaerobic-aerobic moving-bed biofilm reactor system. *Waste
513 Management*, **28**(2), 339-346.

514 Chesters, S.P. 2009. Innovations in the inhibition and cleaning of reverse osmosis membrane
515 scaling and fouling. *Desalination*, **238**(1-3), 22-29.

516 Choo, K.H., Lee, C.H. 1996. Membrane fouling mechanisms in the membrane-coupled
517 anaerobic bioreactor. *Water Research*, **30**(8), 1771-1780.

518 Chu, L.B., Yang, F.L., Zhang, X.W. 2005. Anaerobic treatment of domestic wastewater in a
519 membrane-coupled expanded granular sludge bed (EGSB) reactor under moderate to low
520 temperature. *Process Biochemistry*, **40**(3-4), 1063-1070.

521 Doyle, J.D., Parsons, S.A. 2002. Struvite formation, control and recovery. *Water Research*,
522 **36**(16), 3925-3940.

523 Garvie, L.A.J. 2003. Decay-induced biomineralization of the Saguaro cactus. *American*
524 *Mineralogist*, **88**, 1879-1888.

525 Gonzalez-Munoz, M.T., De Linares, C., Martinez-Ruiz, F., Morcillo, F., Martin-Ramos, D.,
526 Arias, J.M. 2008. Ca-Mg kutnahorite and struvite production by *Idiomarina* strains at modern
527 seawater salinities. *Chemosphere*, **72**(3), 465-472.

528 Hong, S.P., Bae, T.H., Tak, T.M., Hong, S., Randall, A. 2002. Fouling control in activated
529 sludge submerged hollow fiber membrane bioreactors. *Desalination*, **143**(3), 219-228.

530 Imasaka, T., Kanekuni, N., So, H., Yoshino, S. 1989. Cross-Flow Filtration of Methane
531 Fermentation Broth by Ceramic Membranes. *Journal of Fermentation and Bioengineering*,
532 **68**(3), 200-206.

533 Ito, A., Maekawa, M., Tsutsumi, T., Ikazaki, F., Tateishi, T. 1997. Solubility product of OH-
534 carbonated hydroxyapatite. *Journal of Biomedical Materials Research*, **36**(4), 522-528.

535 Juang, Y.C., Aday, S.S., Lee, D.J., Tay, J.H. 2010. Stable aerobic granules for continuous-flow
536 reactors: precipitating calcium and iron salts in granular interiors. *Bioresour. Technol.* , **101**,
537 8061-8067.

538 Kang, I.J., Yoon, S.H., Lee, C.H. 2002. Comparison of the filtration characteristics of organic
539 and inorganic membranes in a membrane-coupled anaerobic bioreactor. *Water Research*, **36**(7),
540 1803-1813.

541 Kim, D., Ryu, H.-D., Kim, M.-S., Kim, J., Lee, S.-I. 2007. Enhancing struvite precipitation
542 potential for ammonia nitrogen removal in municipal landfill leachate. *Journal of Hazardous*
543 *Materials*, **146**(1-2), 81-85.

544 Le Corre, K.S., Valsami-Jones, E., Hobbs, P., Parsons, S.A. 2005. Impact of calcium on struvite
545 crystal size, shape and purity. *Journal of Crystal Growth*, **283**(3-4), 514-522.

546 Li, Y.Z., He, Y.L., Liu, Y.H., Yang, S.C., Zhang, G.J. 2005. Comparison of the filtration
547 characteristics between biological powdered activated carbon sludge and activated sludge in
548 submerged membrane bioreactors. *Desalination*, **174**(3), 305-314.

549 Lin, H., Liao, B.-Q., Chen, J., Gao, W., Wang, L., Wang, F., Lu, X. 2011. New insights into
550 membrane fouling in a submerged anaerobic membrane bioreactor based on characterization
551 of cake sludge and bulk sludge. *Bioresource Technology*, **102**(3), 2373-2379.

552 Lin, Y.P., Singer, P.C. 2005. Inhibition of calcite crystal growth by polyphosphates. *Water*
553 *Research*, **39**(19), 4835-4843.

554 Mahvi, A.H., Razavi, M. 2005. Application of Polyelectrolyte in Turbidity Removal from
555 Surface Water. *American Journal of Applied Sciences*, **2**(1), 397-399.

556 Mamais, D., Pitt, P.A., Cheng, Y.W., Loiacono, J., Jenkins, D. 1994. Determination of Ferric-
557 Chloride Dose to Control Struvite Precipitation in Anaerobic Sludge Digesters. *Water*
558 *Environment Research*, **66**(7), 912-918.

559 Mañas, A., Biscans, B., Spérandio, M. 2011. Biologically induced phosphorus precipitation in
560 aerobic granular sludge process. *Water Res.*, **45**, 3776-3786.

561 McCarty, P.L., McKinney, R. 1961. Salt toxicity in anaerobic digestion. *J. Water Pollut. Control*
562 *Fed.*, **33**, 399-415.

563 Meiron, O.E., Bar-David, E., Aflalo, E.D., Shechter, A., Stepensky, D., Berman, A., Sagi, A.
564 2011. Solubility and bioavailability of stabilized amorphous calcium carbonate. *J. Bone Miner.*
565 *Res.* , **26**(2), 364-372.

566 Mercier-Bonin, M., Daubert, I., Leonard, D., Maranges, C., Fonade, C., Lafforgue, C. 2001.
567 How unsteady filtration conditions can improve the process efficiency during cell cultures in
568 membrane bioreactors. *Separation and Purification Technology*, **22-3**(1-3), 601-615.

569 Montastruc, L., Azzaro-Pantel, C., Biscans, B., Cabassud, M., Domenech, S. 2003. A
570 thermochemical approach for calcium phosphate precipitation modeling in a pellet reactor.
571 *Chemical Engineering Journal*, **94**(1), 41-50.

572 Ohlinger, K.N., Young, T.M., Schroeder, E.D. 1998. Predicting struvite formation in digestion.
573 *Water Research*, **32**(12), 3607-3614.

574 Plant, L.J., House, W.A. 2002. Precipitation of calcite in the presence of inorganic phosphate.
575 *Colloids and Surfaces A: Physicochemical and Engineering Aspects*, **203**(1-3), 143-153.

576 Salek, S.S., Bozkurt, O.D., van Turnhout, A.G., Kleerebezem, R., van Loosdrecht, M.C.M. 2016.
577 Kinetics of CaCO₃ precipitation in an anaerobic digestion process integrated with silicate
578 minerals. *Ecological Engineering*, **86**, 105-112.

579 Seely, O. 2008. Selected Solubility Products and Formation Constants at 25 degree C.
580 <http://www.csudh.edu/oliver/chemdata/data-ksp.htm>.

581 Shih, W.Y., Rahardianto, A., Lee, R.W., Cohen, Y. 2005. Morphometric characterization of
582 calcium sulfate dihydrate (gypsum) scale on reverse osmosis membranes. *Journal of*
583 *Membrane Science*, **252**, 253-263.

584 Shintaro, Y., Keisuke, F. 2012. Removal of phosphate from solution by adsorption and
585 precipitation of calcium phosphate onto monohydrocalcite. *Journal of Colloid and Interface*
586 *Science*, **384**(1), 128-136.

587 Shirazi, S., Lin, C.J., Chen, D. 2010. Inorganic fouling of pressure-driven membrane processes -
588 A critical review. *Desalination*, **250**, 236-248.

589 Sindelar, H.R., Brown, M.T., Boyer, T.H. 2015. Effects of natural organic matter on calcium and
590 phosphorus co-precipitation. *Chemosphere*, **138**, 218-224.

591 Soto, M., Mendez, R., Lema, J.M. 1993. Sodium Inhibition and Sulfate Reduction in the
592 Anaerobic Treatment of Mussel Processing Wastewaters. *Journal of Chemical Technology*
593 *and Biotechnology*, **58**(1), 1-7.

594 Stephenson, T., Judd, S., Jefferson, B., Brindle, K. 2000. *Membrane bioreactors for wastewater*
595 *treatment*. IWA publishing, London.

596 Stratful, I., Scrimshaw, M.D., Lester, J.N. 2001. Conditions influencing the precipitation of
597 magnesium ammonium phosphate. *Water Research*, **35**(17), 4191-4199.

598 Trzcinski, A.P., Stuckey, D.C. 2009a. Anaerobic digestion of the organic fraction of municipal
599 solid waste in a two-stage membrane process. *Water Science and Technology*, **60**(8), 1965-
600 1978.

601 Trzcinski, A.P., Stuckey, D.C. 2009b. Continuous treatment of the organic fraction of municipal
602 solid waste in an anaerobic two-stage membrane process with liquid recycle. *Water Research*,
603 **43**(9), 2449-2462.

604 Weast, R.C. 1963. *Handbook of chemistry and physics : a ready-reference book of chemical and*
605 *physical data. 44th ed.* CRC Press, Cleveland, Ohio.

606 Zayen, A., Aloui, F., Fki, F., Loukil, S., Bouaziz, M., Mnif, S., Sayadi, S. 2008. Anaerobic
607 Membrane Bioreactor for the treatment of Leachate from the landfill solid waste of Jebel
608 Chakir discharge in Tunisia. *5th International Symposium on the Anaerobic Digestion of Solid*
609 *Waste and Energy Crops*, Hammamet, Tunisia.

610 Zhou, D.D., Liu, M.Y., Gao, L.L., Shao, C.Y., Yu, J. 2013. Calcium accumulation
611 characterization in the aerobic granules cultivated in a continuous-flow airlift bioreactor.
612 *Biotechnol. Lett.*, **35**, 871–877.

613

614