

## LABOUR, CAPITAL AND CHANGE

# PROCEEDINGS OF THE 23RD CONFERENCE OF THE ASSOCIATION OF INDUSTRIAL RELATIONS ACADEMICS OF AUSTRALIA AND NEW ZEALAND

VOLUME 1: REFEREED PAPERS
JOHN LEWER, SHAUN RYAN & JOHANNA MACNEIL
EDITORS

4-6 February 2009 Newcastle City Hall, Newcastle, Australia Title: Labour, Capital and Change: Proceedings of the 23rd AIRAANZ Conference, Volume 1

First published February 2009

By the Association of Industrial Relations Academics of Australia and New Zealand (AIRAANZ) Additional copies may be purchased by contacting the Secretary of AIRAANZ.

Author/Contributor: Lewer, John (ed.), Ryan, S. (ed.) and Macneil, Johanna (ed.) Publisher: Newcastle Business School, Faculty of Business and Law, The University of Newcastle

Collection copyright © AIRAANZ 2009

All rights reserved. Except under the conditions described in the Copyright Act 1968 of Australia and subsequent amendments, no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owner.

Cover design by Candice Sferco & Team, All Occasions Management

#### Introduction

As a scholarly association established over twenty years ago of predominantly New Zealand and Australian academics concerned with industrial relations – AIRAANZ – has convened an annual conference as its centrepiece activity. Essential to the ongoing success of the conference has been its hallmark rigor, debate, camaraderie and shared community of interests. The invitation of distinguished keynote speakers to give papers at the conference, as well as providing a forum for new researchers, have reinforced the value and inclusiveness of the conference.

This year's conference held in Newcastle, New South Wales is the twenty-third and its theme is Labour, Capital and Change. We sought, in the tradition of previous conferences, to be sufficiently eclectic to encourage a wide range of contemporary research and thinking about work, its regulation and the organisation of labour. Indeed, the call for papers argued that how the rules over work are made, interpreted and enforced still sits at the kernel of most people's lives. We dispute the popular contention that industrial relations, particularly as measured by the union density and collective bargaining, has lost relevance. In the face of pressures such as the apparent competitive determinism of globalisation, the assertion of managerial power, the rise of individualism, neo-liberalism and a mass media which trivialises or delegitimises organised labour, we argue that industrial relations is more relevant than ever. Indeed, over sixty full papers and abstracts included in these proceedings highlight the reach and vibrancy of research within AIRAANZ and industrial relations generally.

All refereed papers were double-blind assessed by two referees. Papers were subsequently revised (where required) and resubmitted. Referred papers are set out in this CD volume; the companion CD volume incorporates the non-refereed papers and abstracts. We are very appreciative of the thoughtful contribution made by the referees. Thank-you.

The conference is privileged to have three keynote speakers (two of whom will make the wearying journey across the Pacific) - Professor Ruth Milkman, Director of Institute for Labor and Employment for the University of California; Professor Gregor Murray, Director of the Inter-University Research Centre on Globalization and Work; and Dr Michael Schaper, Deputy Chair of the Australian Competition and Consumer Commission. We look forward to their insightful analysis, discussion and informal exchange with the conference delegates.

The Organising Committee are especially appreciative of the fine support for the conference given by Professor Stephen Nicholas and Professor Gordon Boyce in the University of Newcastle's Faculty of Business and Law. Our other sponsors are also warmly acknowledged – the Industrial Relations Society of NSW (Newcastle Branch), the National Tertiary Education Union, the Workplace Ombudsmen, Energy Australia, Newcastle Innovation, and McGraw-Hill.

Finally, and in the manner of earlier editors we are confident that this collection of papers will continue the strong tradition of research analysis and debate that has characterised the past twenty-two AIRAANZ conferences.

John Lewer, Shaun Ryan and Johanna Macneil

Newcastle Business School Faculty of Business and Law The University of Newcastle

#### **DEST Publication Requirements**

In accordance with the Australian Government's Department of Education, Science and Training's Higher Education Research Data Collection criteria, the papers published in these proceedings meet the definition of that research in that:

- 1. The AIRAANZ 2009 Conference is a conference of national and international significance
- 2. Each paper, in its entirety, was double-blind, peer reviewed before publication.
- 3. The proceedings will be made available to libraries and on the AIRAANZ web site.
- 4. Author affiliation is noted on each paper.

The Conference Convenors would like to acknowledge and thank the following people for refereeing the papers in Volume 1 of the AIRAANZ 2009 Conference Proceedings.

University of Newcastle Mark Bray John Burgess University of Newcastle Angela Knox Macquarie University John Lewer University of Newcastle **Duncan Macdonald** University of Newcastle Johanna Macneil University of Newcastle John Nolan University of Newcastle Shaun Ryan University of Newcastle Glenda Strachan Griffith University Pauline Stanton La Trobe University Peter Waring University of Newcastle

Jennifer Waterhouse Queensland University of Technology

Liniversity of Newcostle

Jennifer WhittardUniversity of NewcastleMark WestcottUniversity of SydneySuzzane YoungLa Trobe University

#### Key Themes from the Association of Industrial Relations Academics of Australian and New Zealand (AIRAANZ) Conferences 1983-2004

- 1983 Industrial Relations Studies Down Under: The Need for Intellectual Decolonisation First AIRAANZ Conference; Gippsland, Victoria#
- 1985 Change Second AIRAANZ Conference: Brisbane, Queensland
- 1987 Macroeconomics in Flux: Monetarism, New Classicism and Public Choice: Some Possible Implications for Industrial Relations Theory Third AIRAANZ Conference, Palmerston North, New Zealand#
- 1989 Issues and Trends in Australasian Industrial Relations Fourth AIRAANZ Conference; Wollongong, New South Wales
- 1990 Current Research in Industrial Relations Fifth AIRAANZ Conference; Melbourne, Victoria
- 1992 Contemporary Australasian Industrial Relations Sixth AIRAANZ Conference; Coolangatta, Queensland
- 1993 Divergent Paths? Industrial Relations in Australia, New Zealand and the Asia-Pacific Region – Seventh AIRAANZ Conference, Auckland, New Zealand
- 1994 Developing the Trans-Tasman Link: AIRAANZ and Comparative Analysis of Australian and New Zealand Industrial Relations Eighth AIRAANZ Conference; Coogee, New South Wales\*
- 1995 Current Research in Industrial Relations Ninth AIRAANZ Conference; Melbourne, Victoria
- 1996 Protecting Take Home Pay: Can the Coalition Do Better Than Labor? Tenth AIRAANZ Conference; Perth, Western Australia\*
- 1997 Current Research in Industrial Relations Eleventh AIRAANZ Conference; Brisbane, Queensland^
- 1998 Current Research in Industrial Relations Twelfth AIRAANZ Conference; Wellington, New Zealand^
- 1999 Economics, Industrial Relations and the Challenge of Unemployment Thirteenth AIRAANZ Conference; Adelaide, South Australia#
- 2000 Research on Work, Employment and Industrial Relations Fourteenth AIRAANZ Conference; Newcastle, New South Wales

- 2001 Crossing Borders: Employment, Work, Markets and Social Justice Across Time, Discipline and Place – Fifteenth AIRAANZ Conference; Wollongong, New South Wales
- 2002 Celebrating Excellence in Industrial Relations Practice, Research and Teaching Sixteenth AIRAANZ Conference; Queenstown, New Zealand
- 2003 Reflections and New Directions Seventeenth AIRAANZ Conference; Melbourne, Victoria
- 2004 New Economies: New Industrial Relations Eighteenth AIRAANZ Conference, Noosa, Queensland
- 2005 Reworking Work Nineteenth AIRAANZ Conference, Sydney, New South Wales
- 2006 21<sup>st</sup> Century Work: High Road or Low Road? Twentieth AIRAANZ Conference, Adelaide, South Australia
- 2007 Diverging Employment Relations Patterns in Australia and New Zealand? Twenty-first AIRAANZ Conference, Auckland, New Zealand.
- 2008 Workers, Corporations, and Community: Facing Choices for a Sustainable Future – Twenty-second AIRAANZ Conference, Melbourne, Victoria

#There was no official theme for this conference so the title of the presidential address has been used \*The official theme of these conferences was 'Current Research in Industrial Relations', which has been substituted with the title of the presidential address.

<sup>^</sup>The title of the presidential address for these conferences has not been identified.

### Index REFEREED PAPERS

Bailey, Prices and Esders	Marketing Unions to Young People: Recruiting and 'rusting on'			
Bamber, Gittell, Kochan and von Nordenflycht	Employment Relations in Airlines in European Varieties of Capitalism: Comparative perspectives			
Leggat, Bartram, Stanton and Young	Psychological Empowerment High Performance Work Systems and Perceived Quality of Patient Care			
Brown and Yasukawa	Possibilities of a National Union Education Centre - Views from Australian union leaders			
Bushfield and Martin	Investment in Human Capital and 'Enterprising' Public Services			
Cockfield, Buttigieg, Jerrad, Rainnie	Assessing the Impact of Work Choices on the Low Paid in Victoria			
Eden and Van Gramberg	Investigating Conciliation Claims for Reinstatement in Malaysia: A Research Strategy			
Fan	Union Revitalisation with Chinese Characteristics?			
Fernandes	Diversity Management in Practice: A study of the Australian automotive industry			
Jamieson	Theory, Empiricism and Good Public Policy: The case of work and family in Australia			
Junor, Hammond and Taksa	Forward with (Gender Pay) Fairness?			
Kesting	Providing a Theoretical Foundation for Work-Life Balance – Sen's Capability Approach			
Larkin	Knowledge Flows in MNCs and HRM Practices			
Lavelle, Lamare, Gunnigle and McDonnell	Conceptualising 'Double Breasting' and its Uptake in Multinational Companies: Evidence from Ireland			
Lewer, McComb, Waring and Burgess	Industry superannuation funds and SRI: A lever for better labour practices?			
Ling and Waterhouse	Individual Firms and Regional Business Clusters: The HRM Advantage in Rent Generation			
Lopatika	Tripartism in the Australian Context – Implications for the National OHS Strategy 2002-2012			
Lyons and Ingersoll	Academic Work, Bargaining and Regulation in Australian Universities under the Howard Government			
Maconachie and Goodwin	Enforcing Minimum Labour Standards in Australia from 2010: Correcting or Compounding Problems?			
MacDonald and Graham	Inhibiting Outrage: Tactics and counter-tactics in legal cases of sexual harassment			

McGrath-Champ and Rosewarne	The Australian Construction Industry: Skills Challenges and the Global Labour Market			
North-Samardzic	The rhetoric and reality of EEO: Lessons from a case study			
O'Leary and Sheldon	MULTI-PLANT CAPACITY, EMPLOYER STRATEGY AND INDUSTRIAL CONFLICT IN MEAT PROCESSING: HORMEL, USA (1985-86) AND PORTLAND, AUSTRALIA (1988-89)			
Parker and Foley	Progress on Equity within UK and Canadian Trade Unions – Do women's structures make a difference?			
Postrado, Macneil and Bray	'We came from B Shift, and B Shift was the Enemy': Rules, Norms and Conflict at an Aluminium Smelter			
Provis	On the Definition of Work			
Pugliese and Young	A Multidisciplinary Perspective of the Study of Chronically ill, Injured and Disabled Workers			
Rasmussen, Andersen Nigel Haworth	Has the status seeking quest of human resource management been fulfilled?			
de Ruyter, Warnake, Waring and John Burgess	Minimum Wages: Process and Rationale in Three Neo-Liberal Settings			
Ryan, Lewer and Henderson	Hunter Water, Corporatisation and Employment Relations: A Research Agenda			
Saville	A Pacific Islander Guest Worker Scheme for Australia?: Lessons from New Zealand's Recognised Seasonal Employer Scheme			
Skinner and Pocock	Work, Life and Workplace Culture in Australia in 2008			
Southey	A Conceptual Model of Employee Self Reported Rationale for Engaging in Deviant Acts			
Stanton, Burgess, Vo, Edwards, Lewer Hanif and Bartram	Employment Relations in MNCs: an Australian Story			
Townsend, Wilkinson, Bamber and Allan	The Line Managers' Role in Interpreting, Balancing and Managing 'Mixed Signals'			
Williamson	BARGAINING FOR EQUALITY IN THE AUSTRALIAN PUBLIC SERVICE: TURNING POLICY INTO PRACTICE?			
Willis, Toffoli, Henderson and Walter	Gendered Relations to Working Time: Enterprise Bargaining Outcomes in Acute Care and Community Nursing Settings in Australia			
Woolcock	The Role of Employer Associations: A cross-case comparison of AMMA and the AiG			

Young and Macinati	Outsourcing and Insourcing: A Merry-go-round in health
Zou and Lansbury	Multinational Corporations and Employment Relations in China: The Case of Beijing Hyundai Motor Company