Tools to measure HIV Knowledge, Attitudes & Practices (KAPs) in healthcare

providers: a systematic review

Abstract

Multiple scales have been developed to measure HIV-related stigma among healthcare

providers in lower and middle-income countries. As part of this study to measure HIV stigma

in healthcare providers in Australia, we conducted a systematic search to identify and evaluate

existing tools designed to measure HIV-related Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices (KAPs)

among healthcare providers in higher-income countries. Seven studies were identified that

quantitatively assessed perceived HIV stigma among healthcare providers from the patient

and/or provider perspectives, including HIV stigma as a primary outcome. These seven studies

identified adapted forms of four HIV stigma scales. Assessment of HIV stigma among

providers is valuable to better understand how this phenomenon may adversely impact health

outcomes, and to inform interventions to reduce stigma and improve healthcare. Developing

provider-centred stigma-reduction interventions may also help advance international HIV

prevention and care goals.

Keywords: HIV stigma, measures, healthcare professionals, Australia, high-income countries

Introduction

Globally, stigma and discrimination towards people living with HIV (PLWH) are associated with negative health outcomes (Katz et al., 2013; Mahajan et al., 2008; Phelan, Link, & Dovidio, 2008). Despite advances in HIV treatment and management, stigmatising attitudes persist in healthcare providers (Phelan et al., 2008). Stigmatising attitudes are associated with sub-optimal care, discriminatory practices, inequitable access and outcomes (Arya et al., 2014; Goyal et al., 2013; Landon et al., 2005; Ledda et al., 2017). Stigma can also lead to avoidance or delayed HIV testing, condom use, Pre-Exposure Prophylaxis (PrEP) uptake, medication adherence, care linkage and retention (ASHM, 2012; Fortenberry et al., 2002; Katz et al., 2013; Kinsler, Wong, Sayles, Davis, & Cunningham, 2007; Link & Phelan, 2001; Mahajan et al., 2008; Pascoe & Smart Richman, 2009; Vanable, Carey, Blair, & Littlewood, 2006).

While several studies evaluate HIV-related HIV knowledge, attitudes and practices (KAP) and stigma in healthcare workers in lower- and middle-income countries, there are few in higher income countries (Alexandra Marshall, Brewington, Kathryn Allison, Haynes, & Zaller, 2017; Mullens et al., 2017; Rutledge, Whyte, Abell, Brown, & Cesnales, 2011). One of the few available studies by Sears in Los Angeles (USA) between 2003 and 2006, found 56% of skilled nurses, 26% of cosmetic surgeons and 47% of obstetricians (OB) refused services regardless of disease status (Sears, 2008). Other studies document discriminatory practices including patient avoidance (Blake, Jones Taylor, Reid, & Kosowski, 2008; Schuster et al., 2005), differential treatment or extreme precautionary measures (Elford, Ibrahim, Bukutu, & Anderson, 2008; Sayles, Ryan, Silver, Sarkisian, & Cunningham, 2007). With treatment advances making HIV a treatable chronic condition (Jensen-Fangel et al., 2004), and with HIV testing and care moving beyond specialised HIV clinics, it is important to understand non-HIV specialised healthcare providers HIV KAP. This understanding can determine the necessity of interventions to reduce HIV-related stigma within healthcare services (Geter, Herron, &

Sutton, 2018; Rueda et al., 2016; Stringer et al., 2016). To measure the effectiveness of interventions however, baseline and post-intervention data are needed. These require credible HIV-related stigma measures. The purpose of this review was to identify and critically evaluate available measurement instruments used in higher-income countries.

Methods

Search strategy

A systematic review of the literature was undertaken in July 2019 following the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines (Moher et al., 2015). The search strategy included a combination of keywords or MESH terms and truncated versions of "stigma," "discrimination," "knowledge" "attitudes" "practices" AND "health provider", "medical provider" or "healthcare professional" AND HIV. We included Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices (KAPs) studies given these include measures of stigmatising attitudes and practices attitudes and practices. PubMed, EMBASE, PsycINFO, CINAHL, Cochrane Library, and HIVA databases were used to identify existing tools to measure changes HIV-related stigma in healthcare professional. Google Scholar, WHO database, OECD online library, BHIVA/CROI/EACS/IAS/NHPC conferences databases and other information sources (such as Trip Database, Google Scholar) identified relevant grey literature. Online/offline literature was screened and selected independently by three investigators who assessed the relevance of article title, abstract, and full text against criteria. Key words used were "tool", "scale", "measure", "instrument" "stigma" "knowledge" "attitudes" "practices" "health professional", "health provider", "medical provider". Literature was limited to studies published in English between January 2005 and 31 December 2018 in high income countries based on World Bank criteria (Fantom & Serajuddin, 2016). Where studies used instruments developed before 2005, we sourced original articles to review development.

Several USA scales were developed prior to 2005, including one for hospital workers in 1988 (Pleck, O'donnell, O'donnell, & Snarey, 1988), four for nurses, two in 1994 (Harrison, Fusilier, & Worley, 1994) and 1995 (Preston, Young, Koch, & Forti, 1995), and one in 1997 (Froman & Owen, 1997). These were developed before increased access to combination anti-retroviral therapies (ART). This is important because the advent of ART reframed HIV from an acute, fatal disease to a chronic manageable illness (Samji et al., 2013). This is the reason for selecting two time points.

Inclusion criteria

Eligibility included:

- (1) original research articles/program reports;
- (2) clearly state sample population as health providers who provide HIV services and include those administered only to health professionals;
- (3) measures stigma;
- (4) administered using a standardised, clearly described methodology. Studies were included regardless of the purpose of the measures administered; and
- (5) undertaken in high-income countries (HICs; World Bank, 2018)

Data extraction

Important data from eligible literature were extracted into a standard template. The template included author, year of publication, study location/design, participant characteristics, response rate, methods of testing for validity/reliability, and outcomes. Data were extracted by one reviewer and verified by a second.

(1) Author; (2) Title; (3) Journal; (4) Citation; (5) Study Period; (6) Area (Province, Country); (7) Sample Size And Criteria; (8) Target Population; (9) Study Design; (10) Brief Description Of The Measuring Tool Or Intervention; (11) Purpose Of The Measuring Tool; (12) How Is The Measuring Tool Developed; (13) Measurement Indicators; (14) Validity And Reliability (Risk Of Bias Or Confounding Or Effect Modification In Individual Studies); (16) Study Findings; (17) Conclusion; (18) Impact Factor; (19) Others.

Data quality

Ten percent of total articles were randomly selected and screened by two reviewers. Discrepancies were resolved through reviewer discussion. The COSMIN (consensus-based Standards for the selection of health Measurement Instruments) methodology for systematic reviews of Patient-Reported Outcome Measures informed the evaluation on the instrument quality. The COSMIN is a tool used to improve the selection of outcome measurement instruments in research and clinical practice (Mokkink, De Vet, et al., 2018; Mokkink, Prinsen, et al., 2018; Prinsen et al., 2018; Terwee et al., 2018). While the COSMIN methodology uses the term "patient", the methodology is also applicable for non-patient target populations. In this review, the term "patient" is substituted for "health professional" (Mokkink, Prinsen, et al., 2018; Prinsen et al., 2018; Terwee et al., 2018). The COSMIN methodology evaluates an outcome measure reliability, validity, and responsiveness.

Reliability was assessed on internal consistency, reliability, and measurement error. Internal consistency is the degree of interrelatedness among items, assuming the questionnaire is unidimensional (Mokkink et al., 2010). Reliability is defined as the proportion of the total variance in the measurements due to 'true' differences between patients (Mokkink et al., 2010) and may include test-retest reliability by calculating the intraclass correlation coefficient. Structural validity is defined as the degree to which scores on the questionnaire were an

adequate reflection of the dimensionality of the construct to be measured (Mokkink et al., 2010). Validity was also assessed based on several measurement properties: content validity (including face validity), structural validity, hypotheses testing for construct validity, crosscultural validity and criterion validity. The domain responsiveness (includes one measurement property) relates detection of change over time (Mokkink, De Vet, et al., 2018; Prinsen et al., 2018; Terwee et al., 2018). In this study, the properties of specific outcome measures were evaluated separately for each set of items comprising a score or an outcome. Data were extracted into excel sheets based on the COSMIN recommendations and templates (Mokkink, Prinsen, et al., 2018).

[Insert Table 1 near here]

Results

A summary flowchart of the review process (Figure 1) follows the ten steps for conducting a systematic review of outcome measures as described in the COSMIN methodology. Seven studies were retained with the sample sizes ranging from 121 to 1737. All studies focused on sub-populations of healthcare professionals, for example, medical, surgical and gynaecology unit nurses (Farley et al., 2014; Välimäki et al., 2008); substance use and HIV services agencies staff (Windsor, Benoit, Ream, & Forenza, 2013); healthcare providers caring for PLWH, including medical and nursing students (See et al., 2011); mental health organisations staff (Hughes & Gray, 2009); and medical graduates (Estcourt et al., 2009) and included male and female participants. One study was conducted in three countries (Finland, Estonia and Lithuania) (Välimäki et al., 2008), two in United States of America (Farley et al., 2014; Windsor et al., 2013), two in United Kingdom (Estcourt et al., 2009; Hughes & Gray, 2009), and one in Taiwan (See et al., 2011).

Each retained instrument was developed to measure distinct constructs of HIV-KAP. One study used a modified version of the Nursing Willingness Questionnaire (NWQ) instrument (Välimäki et al., 2008), developed by Dubbert and colleagues (Dubbert, Kemppainen, & White-Taylor, 1994). The original tool was used in the USA and consisted of a 370-word vignette and 13 items measured on a 5-point scale (Dubbert et al., 1994), while the tools used by Välimäki and colleagues adapted the vignette by shortening it to only 13 English words (Välimäki et al., 2008). Another study developed the Provider Perception Inventory (PPI), a 39-item scale measuring health service providers' stigma towards HIV, substance use, and MSM behaviour, including non-gay identified MSM and women (Windsor et al., 2013). While the paper does not detail theories of stigma, it states the scale development was informed by stigma, oppression, labelling theories (Goffman, 1990; Pescosolido, Martin, Lang, & Olafsdottir, 2008; Young, 1990), and hidden distress (Scambler, 2009). Items were derived from focus group discussions with 18 HIV and substance use clinicians (Windsor et al., 2013). The final instrument included a two-dimensional scale: (1) individual attitudes (19 items); and (2) agency environment (11 items) (Windsor et al., 2013).

Hughes and Gray developed a tool to measure mental health workers' HIV KAP and other sexually transmitted diseases in clients with mental illnesses (Hughes & Gray, 2009). The tool consisted of 12 items related to sexual health promotion attitudes; five on HIV knowledge; 13 regarding risk behaviours and risk factors knowledge; five related to glove wearing; and seven about sexual health promotion practices (Hughes & Gray, 2009). In Taiwan, See and colleagues designed a questionnaire to evaluate how effectively healthcare workers interacted with HIV patients and users of illicit substances using a questionnaire measuring four constructs: discrimination, acceptance of PLWH, acceptance of users of illicit substances, and fear (See et al., 2011). To measure knowledge, attitudes, and practices among healthcare workers treating HIV-infected pregnant women Farley et al. (2014) developed a tool consisting

of 18 knowledge items identified from medical literature/CDC guidelines regarding use of antiretroviral therapy (ART) in pregnancy and attitudinal questions modified from the Attitudes Towards Women living with HIV/AIDS Scale (ATWAS; O'Hea, Sytsma, Copeland, & Brantley, 2001; Transmission PoToH-IPWaPoP, 2010). Questions related to practices were developed using clinical guidelines for obstetrical (OB) and HIV care among women of childbearing age and expert opinion (Farley et al., 2014). To measure graduate doctors' views on preparedness to manage patients with sexual health and HIV-related problems in the United Kingdom, Estcourt and colleagues (Estcourt et al., 2009) developed a questionnaire based on the Core Learning Outcomes in Sexual and Reproductive Health and HIV (Estcourt & Evans, 2005).

Three studies examined HIV stigma and/or HIV-KAP in association with other key factors. In Taiwan, See and colleagues observed healthcare workers who had received training/education on harm reduction or HIV prevention had higher scores for acceptance of HIV patients, acceptance of users of illicit substances, and decreased fear, compared with those with no training (See et al., 2011). Estcourt et al. assessed knowledge and skills in sexual health and HIV medicine in pre-registration house officers (Estcourt et al., 2009). In this study, greater confidence in taking a sexual history, discussing HIV testing with patients (including discussing partner notification), and recognising indicators of HIV infection were independently associated with inclusion of sexual health/HIV in the core curriculum (Estcourt et al., 2009). Using the 'Willingness to Care for Patients With HIV/AIDS' instrument, Välimäki et. al found nurses in Finland willing to care for patients with HIV were also more willing to undertake nursing activities for the fictional patient, compared with nurses who were generally not willing to take care of HIV patients (mean score 1.32, SD 0.50 versus mean 1.95, SD 0.90; 45). In the same study, authors found male nurses in Estonia were more willing than female nurses to care for a patient with HIV (mean score 1.34, SD 0.41 versus mean 1.77, SD

0.73, P = 0.002; 45). Also, single nurses in Estonia reported less willingness (than widowed or separated nurses) to care for a patient with HIV, while younger nurses were more willing to engage in nursing activities (r = -0.23, P = 0.017; 45). In Lithuania, nurses with a friend or family member with HIV represented a trend towards more willingness to care for a patient with HIV/AIDS, although this was not statistically significant (Välimäki et al., 2008). In a study of mental health workers, Hughes and Gray reported knowledge about risk behaviours and/or risk factors was associated with previous studies in health promotion (B = 0.17, t = 2.587, p = 0.01; 95% CI 2.15–15.88; Katz et al., 2013). Adherence to glove-wearing was also associated with drug/alcohol training and clinical experience, and knowledge of risk factors was predicted by previous health promotion training (B = 0.245, t = 3.11, p = 0.002; 95% CI 5.55–24.81; Hughes & Gray, 2009). Windsor and colleagues found Catholicism (vs 'other Christian') religious identification and general religiosity were associated with less-tolerant HIV attitudes (Windsor et al., 2013).

Data quality

Reliability

The internal consistency of the NWQ has been established in earlier studies in the United States of America (Dubbert et al., 1994; Kemppainen et al., 1992). In the Välimäki et al. study internal consistency was also very good with the alpha value across the total data set was 0.93 (Finland 0.93, Estonia 0.89 and Lithuania 0.95). Item-to-item correlations (Spearman) were statistically significant for all items of the NWQ, with the exception of bringing a meal tray to the patients versus willingness to clean up faeces or vomit while wearing gloves (Välimäki et al., 2008). In the Välimäki et al. study, retest-retest reliability was not reported (Välimäki et al., 2008), although very good test-retest reliability (r = 10, p = <.001) was shown by Dubbert and colleagues, however sample size was unspecified (Dubbert et al., 1994).

The PPI developed by Windsor et. al (Windsor et al., 2013) demonstrated good internal consistency with overall Cronbach's a=0.87 (individual attitudes (29 items, a=0.87; agency environment, 10 items, a=0.80). The tool developed by Windsor and Gray to examine KAP of mental health workers regarding HIV and other sexually transmitted infections among people with mental illness demonstrated poor internal consistency across three of the four domains (attitudes to sexual health promotion, 12 items, Cronbach's a=0.23; knowledge about HIV in people with schizophrenia, five items, Cronbach's a=0.43; knowledge about risk behaviours, five items, Cronbach's a=0.62; knowledge about risk factors, eight items, Cronbach's a=0.66). The fourth domain of "glove wearing" demonstrated reasonable internal consistency, Cronbach's a=0.75; Hughes & Gray, 2009.

In Taiwan, See and colleagues developed a tool consisting of four constructs (discrimination, acceptance of HIV patients, acceptance of users of illicit substances, and fear). They used Cronbach's alpha to evaluate the internal consistency of each of the four domains, with each demonstrating reasonable internal consistency (discrimination, four items, Cronbach's a = 0.72; acceptance of HIV patients, four items, Cronbach's a = 0.69; acceptance of users of illicit substances, four items, Cronbach's a = 0.73; fear, four items, Cronbach's a = 0.73 (See et al., 2011). The tool developed by Farley et al, did not report any statistics for internal consistency (Transmission PoToH-IPWaPoP, 2010).

Validity

Several of the included instruments used an expert panel to evaluate face or content validity (Hughes & Gray, 2009). Estcourt and colleagues used the Core Learning Outcomes in Sexual and Reproductive Health and HIV for examining the knowledge, attitudes, and practices of obstetricians/gynaecologists and nurses and caring for pregnant women living with HIV (Estcourt et al., 2009). Farley and colleagues reported checking face validity with experts but did not report on any other validity checking properties (Farley et al., 2014). The original

NWQ administered in the USA to over 500 nurses demonstrated good structural validity using Principal Components Analysis (PCA) loading onto a single, unidimensional scale, and accounting for eighty percent of the variance. The Välimäki and colleagues study however, did not report on structural validity nor unidimensionality of the scale.

In developing the PPI, Windsor and colleagues used exploratory factor analysis (EFA) and principal axis factoring with Oblimin (oblique) rotation for the final EFA to confirm structural validity and presence of two distinct sub-scales (individual attitudes; agency environment) (Windsor et al., 2013). Structural equation modelling supported the scale's predictive validity (N=190) (Windsor et al., 2013). The instrument developed by See and colleagues to evaluate professional attitudes of healthcare workers in Taiwan demonstrated good fit to the model using confirmatory factor analysis (See et al., 2011). The AVE (Average Variance Extracted) of the four constructs however was between 0.41 and 0.43, indicating poor convergent validity, however good discriminant validity was demonstrated (See et al., 2011; Strahan & Gerbasi, 1972). Few studies reported on the testing of differential item functioning to reveal if different sub-groups demonstrate different probabilities for endorsing a given item on the instrument. Likewise, while all studies examined internal consistency, few evaluated temporal consistency. Reporting bias may be considered a limitation of all included studies as they all rely on self-reported measures.

Discussion

The results of this systematic review reveal limited empirical evidence on tools measuring KAP (including stigma) among health professionals regarding HIV. Further data may be available in grey literature and non-English studies. These could be useful for future investigation. The other outstanding feature of this review is the limited geographical settings of measures, with just six countries, across three continents (Asia, Europe, North America) represented.

There was a high degree of heterogeneity in the range of health professionals and constructs included, which at times seemed to converge with other constructs (e.g. knowledge, attitudes, willingness to care and different population groups such as substance users and MSM). These findings were further coloured by inclusion of a wide range of measures and the broad range of aspects upon which the scale development was based (e.g., theoretical frameworks, medical literature, clinical guidelines, learning outcomes)—indicating varied inductive and deductive processes. Measure items were also developed using a wide range of sources.

Most studies focussed on rating items based on Likert-type responses. The Nursing Willingness Questionnaire however, used a fictional patient scenario (Dubbert et al., 1994; Välimäki et al., 2008). It was apparent across studies that other key factors tended to influence knowledge, attitudes, stigma and practices including type and age of health professional, previous training/education, gender, marital status and religiosity.

Reliability for internal consistency was generally moderate to good across studies, or not reported. Significantly less information was reported regarding temporal reliability. Less is known about the rigour of validity across studies, with factor analytic-type approaches being most frequently employed to substantiate key constructs/sub-scales, while one study included experts to confirm face validity. The majority of studies reporting on validity however, demonstrated good validity.

Limitations of the studies in this review mitigate potential validity and generalisability to other contexts. Many measures aggregated beliefs about groups other than PLWH (e.g., illicit substance users), or focussed on a specific subset of PLWH (e.g. pregnant women), whilst others included health professionals and other groups (e.g., discrimination, acceptance of patients living with HIV)—making it difficult to draw conclusions specific to HIV-KAP in

health professionals. A further gap is no existing research identified from Australia. There were notable changes in terminology over time (e.g. HIV instead of AIDS), treatment, health outcomes and increased acceptance.

Overall, given the limited number of eligible studies, the wide variation in methodological approaches, aggregation of participant groups and KAP characteristics (beyond solely PLWH), and overlapping features with other constructs and groups, further research with methodological and psychometric rigour is required to adequately measure HIV-KAP among health professionals.

Conclusions

This study identified and evaluated available tools for assessing HIV stigma among healthcare providers in higher income countries. A systematic search of the literature indicated that five studies (2007-2014) adopted forms of four different HIV stigma scales. As such, no standardised measures were identified. This synthesis supports the need for a standardised measure with good reliability and validity for assessing HIV stigma among health professionals. Improved measures may be significant in understanding how stigma affects healthcare outcomes and to inform future interventions to reduce stigma and improve healthcare.

References

- Alexandra Marshall, S., Brewington, K. M., Kathryn Allison, M., Haynes, T. F., & Zaller, N. D. (2017). Measuring HIV-related stigma among healthcare providers: A systematic review. *AIDS Care*, *29*(11), 1337–1345.
- Arya, M., Zheng, M. Y., Amspoker, A. B., Kallen, M. A., Street, R. L., Viswanath, K., & Giordano, T. P. (2014). In the routine HIV testing era, primary care physicians in community health centers remain unaware of HIV testing recommendations. *Journal of the International Association of Providers of AIDS Care (JIAPAC)*, 13(4), 296–299.
- ASHM, N. (2012). Stigma and Discrimination around HIV and HCV in Healthcare Settings: Research Report. *Sydney: ASHM*.
- Blake, B. J., Jones Taylor, G. A., Reid, P., & Kosowski, M. (2008). Experiences of women in obtaining human immunodeficiency virus testing and healthcare services. *Journal of the American Academy of Nurse Practitioners*, 20(1), 40–46.
- Dubbert, P. M., Kemppainen, J. K., & White-Taylor, D. (1994). Development of a measure of willingness to provide nursing care to AIDS patients. *Nursing Administration Quarterly*, 18(2), 16–21.
- Elford, J., Ibrahim, F., Bukutu, C., & Anderson, J. (2008). HIV-related discrimination reported by people living with HIV in London, UK. *AIDS and Behavior*, 12(2), 255–264.
- Estcourt, C., & Evans, D. E. (2005). Core learning outcomes in sexual and reproductive health and HIV for medical undergraduates: Improving skills of future providers. Sexually Transmitted Infections, 81(5), 440–440.

- Estcourt, C., Theobald, N., Evans, D., Lomax, N., Copas, A., David, L., ... Fisher, M. (2009). How do UK medical graduates rate their knowledge and skills in sexual health and HIV medicine? A national survey. *International Journal of STD & AIDS*, 20(5), 324–329.
- Fantom, N., & Serajuddin, U. (2016). *The World Bank's classification of countries by income*. The World Bank.
- Farley, J. E., Hayat, M. J., Murphy, J., Sheridan-Malone, E., Anderson, J., & Mark, H.
 (2014). Knowledge, attitudes, and practices of OB/GYN nurses and auxiliary staff in the care of pregnant women living with HIV. *Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care*, 25(2), 158–167.
- Fortenberry, J. D., McFarlane, M., Bleakley, A., Bull, S., Fishbein, M., Grimley, D. M., ... Stoner, B. P. (2002). Relationships of stigma and shame to gonorrhea and HIV screening. *American Journal of Public Health*, *92*(3), 378–381.
- Froman, R. D., & Owen, S. V. (1997). Further validation of the AIDS Attitude Scale.

 *Research in Nursing & Health, 20(2), 161–167.
- Geter, A., Herron, A. R., & Sutton, M. Y. (2018). HIV-related stigma by healthcare providers in the United States: A systematic review. *AIDS Patient Care and STDs*, 32(10), 418–424.
- Goffman, E. (1990). *Stigma: Notes on the management of spoiled identity*. Harmondsworth: Penguin.
- Goyal, M. K., Dowshen, N., Mehta, A., Hayes, K., Lee, S., & Mistry, R. D. (2013). Pediatric primary care provider practices, knowledge, and attitudes of human immunodeficiency virus screening among adolescents. *The Journal of Pediatrics*, 163(6), 1711–1715.

- Harrison, M., Fusilier, M. R., & Worley, J. K. (1994). Development of a measure of nurses' AIDS attitudes and conservative views. *Psychological Reports*, 74(3), 1043–1048.
- Hughes, E., & Gray, R. (2009). HIV prevention for people with serious mental illness: A survey of mental health workers' attitudes, knowledge and practice. *Journal of Clinical Nursing*, 18(4), 591–600.
- Jensen-Fangel, S., Pedersen, L., Larsen, C. S., Tauris, P., Møller, A., Sørensen, H. T., & Obel, N. (2004). Low mortality in HIV-infected patients starting highly active antiretroviral therapy: A comparison with the general population. *Aids*, *18*(1), 89–97.
- Katz, I. T., Ryu, A. E., Onuegbu, A. G., Psaros, C., Weiser, S. D., Bangsberg, D. R., & Tsai,
 A. C. (2013). Impact of HIV-related stigma on treatment adherence: Systematic
 review and meta-synthesis. *Journal of the International AIDS Society*, 16, 18640.
- Kemppainen, J., St Lawrence, J. S., Irizarry, A., Weidema, D. R., Benne, C., Fredericks, C.
 D., & Wilson, M. (1992). Nurses' willingness to perform AIDS patient care. *The Journal of Continuing Education in Nursing*, 23(3), 110–117.
- Kinsler, J. J., Wong, M. D., Sayles, J. N., Davis, C., & Cunningham, W. E. (2007). The effect of perceived stigma from a health care provider on access to care among a low-income HIV-positive population. *AIDS Patient Care and STDs*, 21(8), 584–592.
- Landon, B. E., Wilson, I. B., McInnes, K., Landrum, M. B., Hirschhorn, L. R., Marsden, P.
 V., & Cleary, P. D. (2005). Physician specialization and the quality of care for human immunodeficiency virus infection. *Archives of Internal Medicine*, 165(10), 1133–1139.
- Ledda, C., Cicciù, F., Puglisi, B., Ramaci, T., Nunnari, G., & Rapisarda, V. (2017). Attitude of health care workers (HCWs) toward patients affected by HIV/AIDS and drug users: A cross-sectional study. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 14(3), 284.

- Link, B. G., & Phelan, J. C. (2001). Conceptualizing stigma. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 27(1), 363–385.
- Mahajan, A. P., Sayles, J. N., Patel, V. A., Remien, R. H., Ortiz, D., Szekeres, G., & Coates, T. J. (2008). Stigma in the HIV/AIDS epidemic: A review of the literature and recommendations for the way forward. *AIDS (London, England)*, 22(Suppl 2), S67.
- Moher, D., Shamseer, L., Clarke, M., Ghersi, D., Liberati, A., Petticrew, M., ... PRISMA-P Group. (2015). Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015 statement. *Systematic Reviews*, 4, 1. https://doi.org/10.1186/2046-4053-4-1
- Mokkink, L. B., De Vet, H. C., Prinsen, C. A., Patrick, D. L., Alonso, J., Bouter, L. M., & Terwee, C. B. (2018). COSMIN Risk of Bias checklist for systematic reviews of Patient-Reported Outcome Measures. *Quality of Life Research*, 27(5), 1171–1179.
- Mokkink, L. B., Prinsen, C., Patrick, D. L., Alonso, J., Bouter, L. M., de Vet, H. C., ... Mokkink, L. (2018). COSMIN methodology for systematic reviews of patient-reported outcome measures (PROMs). *User Manual*, 78, 1.
- Mokkink, L. B., Terwee, C. B., Patrick, D. L., Alonso, J., Stratford, P. W., Knol, D. L., ... de Vet, H. C. (2010). The COSMIN study reached international consensus on taxonomy, terminology, and definitions of measurement properties for health-related patient-reported outcomes. *Journal of Clinical Epidemiology*, 63(7), 737–745.
- Mullens, A. B., Fischer, J., Stewart, M., Kenny, K., Garvey, S., & Debattista, J. (2017).

 Comparison of government and non-government alcohol and other drug (AOD) treatment service delivery for the lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender (LGBT) community. Substance Use & Misuse, 52(8), 1027–1038.

- O'Hea, E. L., Sytsma, S. E., Copeland, A., & Brantley, P. J. (2001). The attitudes toward women with HIV/AIDS scale (ATWAS): Development and validation. *AIDS Education and Prevention*, *13*(2), 120–130.
- Pascoe, E. A., & Smart Richman, L. (2009). Perceived discrimination and health: A metaanalytic review. *Psychological Bulletin*, *135*(4), 531.
- Pescosolido, B. A., Martin, J. K., Lang, A., & Olafsdottir, S. (2008). Rethinking theoretical approaches to stigma: A framework integrating normative influences on stigma (FINIS). *Social Science & Medicine*, 67(3), 431–440.
- Phelan, J. C., Link, B. G., & Dovidio, J. F. (2008). Stigma and prejudice: One animal or two? Social Science & Medicine, 67(3), 358–367.
- Pleck, J. H., O'donnell, L., O'donnell, C., & Snarey, J. (1988). AIDS-phobia, contact with AIDS, and AIDS-related job stress in hospital workers. *Journal of Homosexuality*, 15(3–4), 41–54.
- Preston, D. B., Young, E. W., Koch, P. B., & Forti, E. M. (1995). The Nurses' Attitudes

 About AIDS Scale (NAAS): Development and psychometric analysis. *AIDS*Education and Prevention.
- Prinsen, C. A., Mokkink, L. B., Bouter, L. M., Alonso, J., Patrick, D. L., De Vet, H. C., & Terwee, C. B. (2018). COSMIN guideline for systematic reviews of patient-reported outcome measures. *Quality of Life Research*, 27(5), 1147–1157.
- Rueda, S., Mitra, S., Chen, S., Gogolishvili, D., Globerman, J., Chambers, L., ... Morassaei, S. (2016). Examining the associations between HIV-related stigma and health outcomes in people living with HIV/AIDS: A series of meta-analyses. *BMJ Open*, 6(7), e011453.

- Rutledge, S. E., Whyte, J., Abell, N., Brown, K. M., & Cesnales, N. I. (2011). Measuring stigma among health care and social service providers: The HIV/AIDS provider stigma inventory. *AIDS Patient Care and STDs*, *25*(11), 673–682.
- Samji, H., Cescon, A., Hogg, R. S., Modur, S. P., Althoff, K. N., Buchacz, K., ... Gill, M. J. (2013). Closing the gap: Increases in life expectancy among treated HIV-positive individuals in the United States and Canada. *PloS One*, 8(12), e81355.
- Sayles, J. N., Ryan, G. W., Silver, J. S., Sarkisian, C. A., & Cunningham, W. E. (2007). Experiences of social stigma and implications for healthcare among a diverse population of HIV positive adults. *Journal of Urban Health*, 84(6), 814.
- Scambler, G. (2009). Health-related stigma. *Sociology of Health & Illness*, *31*(3), 441–455. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9566.2009.01161.x
- Schuster, M. A., Collins, R., Cunningham, W. E., Morton, S. C., Zierler, S., Wong, M., ... Kanouse, D. E. (2005). Perceived discrimination in clinical care in a nationally representative sample of HIV-infected adults receiving health care. *Journal of General Internal Medicine*, 20(9), 807–813.
- Sears, B. (2008). HIV discrimination in health care services in Los Angeles County: The results of three testing studies. *Wash. & Lee J. Civil Rts. & Soc. Just.*, 15, 85.
- See, L.-C., Shen, Y.-M., Chen, C.-L., Huang, T.-M., Huang, Y.-H., Huang, H.-C., & Lin, S.-R. (2011). Professional attitude of health care workers toward serving HIV/AIDS patients and drug users: Questionnaire design and evaluation of reliability and validity. *AIDS Care*, *23*(11), 1448–1455.
- Strahan, R., & Gerbasi, K. C. (1972). Short, homogeneous versions of the Marlow-Crowne social desirability scale. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 28(2), 191–193.

- Stringer, K. L., Turan, B., McCormick, L., Durojaiye, M., Nyblade, L., Kempf, M.-C., ...

 Turan, J. M. (2016). HIV-related stigma among healthcare providers in the deep south. *AIDS and Behavior*, 20(1), 115–125.
- Terwee, C. B., Prinsen, C. A., Chiarotto, A., Westerman, M. J., Patrick, D. L., Alonso, J., ... Mokkink, L. B. (2018). COSMIN methodology for evaluating the content validity of patient-reported outcome measures: A Delphi study. *Quality of Life Research*, 27(5), 1159–1170.
- Transmission PoToH-IPWaPoP. (2010). Recommendations for Use of Antiretroviral Drugs in

 Pregnant HIV-1-Infected Women for Maternal Health and Interventions to Reduce

 Perinatal HIV Transmission in the United States.
- Välimäki, M., Makkonen, P., Blek-Vehkaluoto, M., Mockiene, V., Istomina, N., Raid, U., ...

 Suominen, T. (2008). Willingness to care for patients with HIV/AIDS. *Nursing Ethics*, *15*(5), 586–600. https://doi.org/10.1177/0969733008092868
- Vanable, P. A., Carey, M. P., Blair, D. C., & Littlewood, R. A. (2006). Impact of HIV-related stigma on health behaviors and psychological adjustment among HIV-positive men and women. *AIDS and Behavior*, *10*(5), 473–482.
- Windsor, L. C., Benoit, E., Ream, G. L., & Forenza, B. (2013). The provider perception inventory: Psychometrics of a scale designed to measure provider stigma about HIV, substance abuse, and MSM behavior. *AIDS Care*, 25(5), 586–591.
- World Bank. (2018). World Bank Country Classifications. Retrieved from The World Bank website: https://dental.washington.edu/wp-content/media/research/WorldBank EconomyRanks 2018.pdf
- Young, I. M. (1990). Throwing like a girl. Bloomington, IN, Indiana Press.

Table 1

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
Willingness	Välimäk	Finland	Total N=	Nurses	A modified	Nurses'	The instrument	The alpha value in	Previous studies
to care for	i et al,	,Estonia	833	working in	version of a scale	Willingness	was piloted with	the current study for	suggest that this
patients	2008	and		medical,	"willingness to	Questionnair	intensive care	the total data set	questionnaire is a
with		Lithuania	(n=427) in	surgical and	provide nursing	e was	nurses from the	was 0.93, which	reliable and valid
HIV/AIDS			Finland,	gynaecology	care to AIDS	translated by	same hospitals	varied as follows:	instrument for
			(n=221) in	units.	patients"	official	as those	Finland 0.93,	evaluating a
			Estonia and		developed in	language	included in the	Estonia 0.89 and	construct of current
			(n=185) in		1994 by	translators	main study as	Lithuania 0.95.	concern to nursing
			Lithuania			into the most	follows: in	Item-to-item	administrators and
						common	Estonia n=35	correlations	educators.

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					Dubbertet et al ¹ ,	languages	(Estonian	(Spearman) were	
			601		was applied.	used in each	language n=17,	statistically	The background
			Responded		This version was	country.	Russian	significant for all	variable used
			(Average		reduced to a		language n=18),	items of nursing	showed good face
			response		vignette of 13	Before data	and Lithuania	activity except for	validity
			rate= 72%)		English words to	collection the	n=30.	bringing a meal tray	
					describe a patient	questionnaire		to the patient versus	
					with AIDS whose	was piloted	Pearsons'	willingness to clean	
					health was	in Estonia	product moment	up faeces or vomit	

¹ Dubbert PM, Kemppainen JK, White-Taylor D. Development of a measure of willingness to provide nursing care to AIDS patients. Nurs Adm Q 1994; 18(2): 16–21.

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					deteriorating in a	and Lithuania	correlation	while wearing	
					5 score Likert	to refine the	coefficients	gloves.	
					scale	instrument to	were used to		
					(1 strongly agree,	suit different	examine		
					2 agree, 3	cultural	correlations		
					undecided, 4	contexts.	between the		
					disagree, 5		willingness scale		
					strongly disagree)		and numerical		
							background		
							variables.		

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
The	Windsor	USA	N=212	HIV and	The provider		Thematic	The final EFA	2 FGDs conducted
provider	et al			substance	perception		analysis of focus	solution included a	for participants
perception	2013		89.6%	abuse service	inventory (PPI) is		group transcripts	total of 39 items	from 18 HIV and
inventory:			(190	providers	a 39-item scale		were carried out	across two	substance abuse
Psychometri			Responded		that measures		Focus groups	dimensions: (1)	treatment providers
cs)		health services		members were	individual attitudes	for face validity
of a scale					providers' stigma		HIV and	(29 items, $\alpha = 0.87$)	Exploratory Factor
designed to					about HIV/AIDS,		substance abuse	and (2) agency	Analysis(EFA)
measure					substance use,		service	environment (10	
provider					and MSM		providers	items, $\alpha = 0.80$). The	112 of the original
stigma					behaviour.			overall Cronbach's	items were

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
about HIV,							who were	α for the Provider	included in the
substance					The development		ethnically	Perception	initial EFA. Items
abuse, and					was Informed by		diverse and had	Inventory(PPI) was	with communalities
MSM					a focus group of		worked in both	0.87	below 0.3 were
behaviour					health providers		residential and		dropped and the
					and a Spanish		outpatient drug		EFA rerun.
					HIV/AIDS		treatment as well		
					stigma scale		as harm		For the final EFA,
					(Varas-Diaz &		reduction and		principal axis
							HIV outreach		factoring were used
							and testing.		and oblimin

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					Neilands, 2009 ²)				(oblique) rotation
					and the index of				because factors
					attitudes toward				were expected to be
					homosexuals				correlated (Costello
					(Siebert et al.,				& Osborne,
					2009 ³).				2005).After settling
									on subscale
									components, a

² Varas-Diaz, N., & Neilands, T.B. (2009). Development and validation of a culturally appropriate HIV/AIDS stigma scale for Puerto Rican health professionals in training. AIDS Care, 21(10), 12591270. doi:10.1080/09540120902804297

³ Siebert, D.C., Chonody, J., Rutledge, S.E., & Killian, M. (2009). The index of attitudes toward homosexuals 30 years later: A psychometric study. Research on Social Work Practice, 19(2), 214220. doi:10.1177/1049731508318553

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					Also informed by				single structural
					stigma,				equations model
					oppression and				(SEM) were
					labeling theories				conducted in Mplus
					(Goffman,				6.0 with latent
					1959,1963;				indicators for the
					Pescosolido,				subscales as
					Martin, Lang, &				dependent variables
					Olafsdottir, 2008;				and provider
					Young, 1990) as				characteristics as
					well as				independent

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					Scambler's				variables(predictive
					(2009) hidden				validity) .The SEM
					distress model				final sample
									(n=190)
									participants.
									Model fit was just
									within the
									boundaries of
									acceptable
									according to

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
									absolute measures
									of fit (root mean
									square error of
									approximation
									[RMSEA] and
									standardized root
									mean square
									residual [SRMR])
									and unacceptable
									according to
									incremental

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
									measures (Tucker-
									Lewis Index [TLI]
									& Comparative Fit
									Index [CFI])
HIV	Hughes	UK	Sample	Mental health	No validated tool		Process	The tool	The face validity of
prevention	& Gray		size= 650	workers from	was identified in		overseen by	demonstrate lower	a draft
for people	2007		(n = 283)	NHS mental	the literature so		multidisciplinary	than reasonanle	questionnaire was
with serious			(health	the research team		steering group,	internal consistency	reviewed by the
mental			44%	services,	designed a		responsible for		study steering
illness: a			response	providing care	questionnaire		protocol	The Cronbach's	group and
survey of			rate)	for working	with 42		development,	alpha coefficient for	amendments were

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
mental				age adults with	statements		questionnaire	'attitudes to sexual	made accordingly.
health				mental health	organised into		design, quality	health promotion'	The second version
workers'				problems.	five subscales:		assurance and	was poor: alpha =	was piloted with a
attitudes,					(1) Attitudes to		the	0.23. (individual	group of 10 mental
knowledge					sexual health		dissemination of	items were not	health workers to
and practice					promotion (12		the findings of	related to the overall	establish
					items; (2)		the study.	construct)	acceptability and
					Knowledge about				face validity.
					HIV/AIDS (five		A post-hoc	The Cronbach's a	The final version of
					items): multiple		linear regression	for 'knowledge	the questionnaire
					choice questions		was performed		had 42 statements

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					;(3) Knowledge		on all the	about HIV/AIDS in	organised into five
					about risk		dependent	people	subscales.
					behaviours and		variables to	with schizophrenia'	
					risk factors for		investigate if	was 0.43, due to the	
					HIV infection (13		demographic	short subscale	
					items); (4) Glove		variables (such	(n = 5).	
					wearing (five		as gender, age,		
					items);(5)		professional	The	
					Reported sexual		background) had	subscales of	
					health promotion		a significant	'knowledge about	
					practice (seven		relationship to		

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					items);(6)		the scores.	risk behaviours' (a	
					Finally, there		Finally, the	= 0.62)	
					were two open-		relationships	and 'knowledge	
					ended questions		between attitude,	about risk factors'	
					about what		knowledge and	(a = 0.66)	
					training should be		reported practice		
					available and		subscales were	Alpha coefficient	
					what services and		investigated	for 'glove wearing'	
					resources should		using Pearson's	= 0.75.	
					be available for		correlation.		
					the prevention of				

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					STI and HIV				
					infection in				
					people with SMI.				
Professional	See et al,	Taiwan	Sample=	healthcare	After reviewing		Reliability and	Cronbach's alpha to	Ten experts
attitude of	2011		540	workers who,	the relevant		validity test of	determine internal	(psychological
healthcare			(n=251)	in their work,	literature, four		confirmatory	consistency of	counselling,
workers			90.3%	served	constructs were		factor analysis	observed variables.	medical care, police
toward			response	HIV/AIDS	selected for the		(CFA) used.		work, or the penal
serving			rate. Only		questionnaire:			Outcome analysis	system) rated the
HIV/AIDS					discrimination,			yielded a composite	questionnaire on

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
patients and			251 was	patients or	acceptance of		•The difference	reliability and	appropriateness,
drug users:			eligible	drug users,	HIV/AIDS		in prior training	Cronbach's $a = 0.7$.	comprehensiveness,
questionnair				including:	patients,		was evaluated		and relevance, and
e design and				public health	acceptance of		using	Construct/composit	the mean content
evaluation				workers;	drug users, and		Independent t-	e reliability of	validity index was
of reliability				physicians;	fear ⁴		test.	professional	85.6%. All changes
and validity				registered	Four questions		•First-order and	attitudes	to the questionnaire
				nurses;	were designed for		second-order		were made
				pharmacist etc.	each construct		CFA was used.		

⁴ (Gerbert et al., 1991; Hong Kong Council of Social Service [HKCSS], 2002;McCann & Sharkey, 1998; Taiwan Root Medical Peace Corps, 2002).

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					with four answer		•Structure	(CR > 0.7) was	according to the
					choices ranging		loading (l) was	computed to assess	experts' opinions.
					from strongly		used to describe	the	
					disagree to		the relation	internal consistency	•Average variance
					strongly agree.		between	of each observed	extracted (AVE)
							observed	variable within a	was calculated to
							variables and	latent variable	examine
					Negative		latent variables.		convergent validity
					questions were		•Individual item		and to discriminate
					reverse-scored to		reliability, R2,		the validity of
					ensure that the		was used to		latent variables.

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					direction was		assess whether		(The AVE of the
					consistent for all		each observed		four constructs of
					items and higher		variable		job attitude was
					scores		reflected the		between 0.41 and
					represented a		latent variable.		0.43, indicating low
					more positive		•Construct		convergent validity.
					professional		reliability was		•There was a high
					attitude.		computed to		correlation (r=0.80)
							assess the		for acceptance of
							internal		HIV/AIDS patients
							consistency of		

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
							each observed		and drug users, the
							variable within a		square root of the
							latent variable.		AVE for each
									construct was
							The differences		greater than the
							in mean scores		other correlation
							for three		coefficients,
							constructs of the		thereby revealing
							questionnaire		good discriminant
							(acceptance of		Validity.
							HIV/AIDS		

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
							patients,		•First-order and
							acceptance of		second-order
							drug users, and		confirmatory factor
							fear) were		analysis revealed a
							statistically		x2/degrees of
							significant.		freedom B3,
							Hence, the		goodness-of-fit
							questionnaire		index (GFI) 0.9,
							had good		adjusted goodness-
							reliability and		of-fit index (AGFI)
							validity		0.9, Bentler

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
									Bonnett normal fix
									index 0.9, and a
									root mean square
									error of
									approximation
									between 0.00 and
									0.07 indicating a
									good fit of the
									model.

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
Knowledge,	Farley et	USA	N= 121	Obstetric and	Questionnaire			Analysis of	Before
Attitudes,	al 2014		Response	gynaecological	were developed			variance, Kruskal-	implementation, the
and			rate is	(OB/GYN)	from the			Wallis, or	survey components
Practices of			57.1%	healthcare	following:			Independent-	were piloted with a
OB/GYN				workers	Medical			samples t tests were	panel of 10 HIV
Nurses and					literature			used to compare	and/or OB nurses
Auxiliary					• C.D.C.			total and subscale	and physician
Staff in the					guidelines on			attitude survey	specialists for face
Care of					the use of			scores across	validity.
Pregnant					antiretroviral			demographic	
					therapy			variables.	

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
Women					(ART) in				
Living With					pregnancy ⁵ .			The significance	
HIV					• Attitudes			level for this study	
					Toward			was set at alpha =	
					Women			0.05.	
					living with				
					HIV/AIDS			With multiple	
					Scale ⁶			comparisons, a	

⁵ (Panel on Treatment of HIV-Infected Pregnant Women and Prevention of Perinatal Transmission, 2010) ⁶ (ATWAS; O'Hea, Sytsma, Copeland, & Brantley, 2001) to reflect women of childbearing years and pregnancy.

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					Clinical			Bonferroni	
					guidelines for			adjustment was	
					OB and HIV			used to lowers the	
					care among			probability of a type	
					women of			I error.	
					childbearing				
					age as well as				
					expert				
					opinion.				

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
How do UK	Estcourt	UK	Sample	UK medical	Questionnaire		The	Associations	Revised the
medical	et al,		size 4746	graduates of	were developed		questionnaires	between	questionnaire after
graduates	2009			August 2004	using the Core		were	explanatory factors	a pilot phase with a
rate their			N=1737		Learning		anonymized, but	and confidence	small group of
knowledge					Outcomes in		coded to allow a	measures were	preregistration
and skills in			1737		Sexual and		second round of	presented as odds	house officers
sexual			(36.4%		Reproductive		questionnaires to	ratios with 95%	(PRHOs)
health and			response		Health and		be sent out to	confidence intervals	
HIV			rate).				non-responders	and testing based on	
medicine?							six weeks after	logistic regression.	
							the first one	The simultaneous	

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
A national					HIV ⁷ and used			association of	
survey					both tick box			multiple	
					responses and			explanatory factors	
					five-point Likert			were examined	
					scales.			using multiple	
					(Conducted via			logistic regression.	
					postal			Agreement between	
								related items was	

⁷ Estcourt C, Evans DE. Core learning outcomes in sexual and reproductive health and HIV for medical undergraduates: improving skills of future providers. Sex Transm Infect 2005;81:440

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
					questionnaire			assessed using the	
					survey)			kappa statistic	
The	Tyer-	USA	(N = 210)	Registered	Attitudes toward		Reliability was	The new measure	Was previously
Pregnant	Viola &.		yielding a	Nurses who	Women living		analysed using	demonstrated high	(2005) developed
Women	Duffy,		response	provide care in	with HIV Scale		Cronbach's	internal consistency	in 5 stages Face
living with	2009		rate	labour and	(ATWAS)(O'Hea		Alpha.	(alpha estimates	and content
HIV				delivery units	et al. 2001) and			= 0.89). Principal	validity, pilot
Attitude				throughout the	the Attitudes		Items in the	component analysis	testing with OB
Scale:				USA	about People with		scale was	yielded a two-	nurses, factor
developmen					HIV Scale		compared for	component structure	analysis, and
t and initial					(APHS) (Green		reliability. 'The		validity testing (N

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
psychometri					1995) were		higher the	that accounted for	= 210) (Tyer-
c evaluation					combined to		correlations	45% of the total	Viola, 2005).
					create the		among items,	variance:	Content validity
					Pregnant Women		the higher the	Mothering-Choice	was used for item
					living with HIV		reliability of	(alpha estimates	pool development
					Attitudes Scale		individual items'	= 0.89) and	and principal
					(PWHAS).		(DeVellis 1991,	Sympathy-Rights	component analysis
							p. 80).	(alpha estimates =	and analysis of
								0.72).	variance were used
							More items are		to determine
							needed to		construct validity.

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
							determine the		
							reliability of the		Hypothesis testing
							scale		using known
									groups techniques
									was carried out to
									provide further
									evidence of
									construct validity.
									The 27 items from
									the ATWAS and

Title	Author/s	Study	Sample	Participant	Underlying	Cross cultural	Methods used to	Internal consistency	Methods used to
	and year	location	size and	characteristic	theory	validity/	assess		assess structural
		and	response	(Study		measurement	reliability (if		validity (if
		language	rate	subjects		invariance	applicable)		applicable)
		used		described)					
									the 15-item APHS
									were combined for
									face validity
									assessment by
									experts in attitude
									and survey
									research; maternal
									child health and
									psychiatric nursing
									for PLHIV